## PARK CITY MUNICIPAL CORPORATION HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS November 4, 2015



## AGENDA

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER AT 5:00 PM ROLL CALL PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS – Items not scheduled on the regular agenda STAFF/BOARD COMMUNICATIONS AND DISCLOSURES REGULAR AGENDA – Discussion and possible action as outlined below

Review of demolition permits for the following Buildings and Structures to be

considered under the pending ordinance:

221 Main Street - Demolition Determination – The applicant is requesting to move an existing vent on the South side roof of the building as well as add ventilation on the upper loft level, coming through new roof materials on a Landmark site.

BD-15-21863 3 Planner Hawley

Public hearing and possible action

ADJOURN



Historic Preservation Board Staff Report

**Planning Department** 

Author:	Makena Hawley, Planner Tech
Subject:	Demolition Review
Address:	221 Main Street
Project Number:	BD-15-21863
Date:	November 4, 2015
Type of Item:	Administrative – Demolition Determination

## **Summary Recommendation:**

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board review the application, conduct a public hearing, and approve the removal of non-historic roofing material in order to add 4 new exhaust pipes on the south elevation at 221 Main Street.

## Topic:

Address:	221 Main Street
Designation:	Landmark
Applicant:	Seth Adams
Proposal:	The applicant intends to remove the non-historic roofing in order to add 4 new exhaust pipes on the south elevation of the non-historic rear addition.

## **Background:**

On August 6, 2015, the City Council directed the Planning Department to move forward with a pending ordinance. The purpose of the pending ordinance is to expand the Historic Sites Inventory criteria to include the following terms:

- Any structure that has received a historic grant from the City;
- Has previously been on the Historic Site Inventory or listed as significant or contributory on any recognizant or other historic survey;
- Or despite non-historic additions retain its historic scale, context, materials in a manner and degree which can reasonably be restored to historic form.

In addition, the pending ordinance is also to amend Land Management Code (LMC) to include demolition permits for all structures in a Historic District to be reviewed by the Historic Preservation Board.

On September 16, 2015, the applicant submitted a Building Permit for the relocation of their mechanical room, thus requiring them to remove non-historic roofing on the south (side) roof in order to install the new exhaust pipes in at 221 Main Street. The structure is listed as Landmark on the Historic Sites Inventory (HSI); however, the work will occur on the rear addition. This addition to the west side of the structure was originally constructed in 1907; however, it was severely damaged by a fire in 1940 and was not restored until the building underwent a significant renovation in 1985. The current asphalt shingle roof dates from 2011.

## Analysis:

Staff finds that the proposed work is a minor alteration having little or no negative impact on the historic character of the surrounding neighborhood or the Historic District.

The 4 new exhaust pipes on the south (side) elevation of the building are being placed through non-historic material. A building permit was issued on December 19, 2011 for a re-roof, so the existing asphalt shingle roof is not historic. The holes in the roof for the exhaust pipes will measure less than six inches (6") in diameter in 4 different spots that will not be visible from the public right-of-way.

The interior mechanical room is being relocated due to an interior remodel and the work is considered minor construction and routine maintenance.

## **Recommendation:**

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board review the application, conduct a public hearing, and approve the demolition of non-historic roofing on the south rear end of 221 Main Street.

## Finding of Fact:

- 1. The property is located at 221 Main Street.
- 2. The building is listed as Landmark on the Historic Sites Inventory.
- 3. The property is located within the Historic Commercial Business (HCB) District.
- 4. On September 16, 2015 the applicant submitted a Building Permit for the relocation of the interior mechanical room which proposes to affect the exterior by adding 4 exhaust pipes through the non-historic south roofing at 221 Main Street.
- 5. The removal of the non-historic roofing is considered minor construction and routine maintenance. It can be determined that the roofing on 221 Main St. is non-historic because a Building Permit for a re-roof was issued on December 19, 2011.
- 6. The removal of the non-historic asphalt shingles will not affect the historic materials of the building.

## **Conclusions of Law:**

1. The proposal complies with the Land Management Code requirements pursuant to the HR-M District and the August 6, 2015 pending ordinance.

## **Conditions of Approval:**

- Final building plans and construction details shall reflect substantial compliance with the proposal stamped in on September 14, 2015. Any changes, modifications, or deviations from the approved design that have not been approved by the Planning and Building Departments may result in a stop work order.
- 2. An HDDR Waiver Letter by the Planning Director is required for the approved design before a Building Permit can be issued by the Building Department.

Exhibits: Exhibit A – Proposed Work Plans Exhibit B – Historic Sites Inventory





## **GENERAL NOTES**

DATUM ELEVATION: Civil 7127'-5 1/2" = Architectural 100'-0" See SV-001 for Enlarged Encroachments and Additional Information.

# CONSTRUCTION MITIGATION

Restroom will be made available in lower level. See Attached letter from owner. Staging of materials and storage or rubble and demolition will be contained within the 2. building and deposited or removed as needed.



## ELLIOTT WORKGROUP

Elliott Workgroup Architecture, LLC 364 Main Street, P.O. Box 3419 Park City, Utah 84060 (435)649-0092 or (801)415-1839 elliottworkgroup.com





Elliott Workgroup Architecture, LLC 364 Main Street, P.O. Box 3419 Park City, Utah 84060 (435)649-0092 or (801)415-1839 elliottworkgroup.com





Elliott Workgroup Architecture, LLC 364 Main Street, P.O. Box 3419 Park City, Utah 84060 (435)649-0092 or (801)415-1839 elliottworkgroup.com



Page 8 of 27

OF

SHEET







Historic Preservation Board Packet November 4, 2015

\_\_\_\_\_



Elliott Workgroup Architecture, LLC 364 Main Street, P.O. Box 3419 Park City, Utah 84060 (435)649-0092 or (801)415-1839 elliottworkgroup.com

Page 9 of 27

## **HISTORIC SITE FORM - HISTORIC SITES INVENTORY**

PARK CITY MUNICIPAL CORPORATION (10-08)

### **1 IDENTIFICATION**

### Name of Property: Bogan Boarding House

Address: 221 MAIN ST

AKA:

City, County: Park City, Summit County, Utah

Tax Number: PC-193

Current Owner Name: 221 MAIN STREET LLC, C/O: AVENUE COMMUNITIES Parent Parcel(s):

Current Owner Address: 230 W FIFTH ST, TEMPE, AZ 85281

Legal Description (include acreage): Legal SUBD: PARK CITY BLOCK 12 BLOCK: 12 LOT: 5 AND:- LOT: 6BUILDING: 0.00N 5 FT OF LOT 5 & ALL LOT 6 BLK 12 PARK CITY SURVEY M98-120 311-371 326-203 622-296 762-120 1056-57 1542-1073 1588-439 1851-550, 06 AC

## 2 STATUS/USE

Property Category	<u>Evaluation*</u>	<u>Reconstruction</u>	<u>Use</u>
☑ building(s), main	Interpretended Landmark Site	Date:	Original Use: Residential
building(s), attached	Significant Site	Permit #:	Current Use: Residential
building(s), detached	☐ Not Historic	🗆 Full 🛛 Partial	
building(s), public			
building(s), accessory			
□ structure(s)	*National Register of Historic Places: 🗆 ineligible 🛛 🗹 eligible		
	☑ listed (date: 10/22/1984 - Mining Boom Era Residences Thematic District)		

## **3 DOCUMENTATION**

Photos: Dates	<u>Research Sources</u> (check all sources consulted, whether useful or not)		
□ tax photo:	□ abstract of title	☑ city/county histories	
☑ prints:	☑ tax card	personal interviews	
☐ historic: c.	original building permit	Utah Hist. Research Center	
	□ sewer permit	USHS Preservation Files	
Drawings and Plans	☑ Sanborn Maps	USHS Architects File	
measured floor plans	□ obituary index	LDS Family History Library	
□ site sketch map	□ city directories/gazetteers	Park City Hist. Soc/Museum	
Historic American Bldg. Survey	□ census records	university library(ies):	
original plans:	biographical encyclopedias	□ other:	
□ other:	□ newspapers		

Bibliographical References (books, articles, interviews, etc.) Attach copies of all research notes and materials.

Blaes, Dina & Beatrice Lufkin. "Final Report." Park City Historic Building Inventory. Salt Lake City: 2007.

Carter, Thomas and Goss, Peter. Utah's Historic Architecture, 1847-1940: a Guide. Salt Lake City, Utah:

University of Utah Graduate School of Architecture and Utah State Historical Society, 1991.

McAlester, Virginia and Lee. A Field Guide to American Houses. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1998.

Notarianni, Philip F., "Park City Main Street Historic District." National Register of Historic Places Inventory, Nomination Form. 1979.

Roberts, Allen. "Final Report." Park City Reconnaissance Level Survey. Salt Lake City: 1995.

Roper, Roger & Deborah Randall. "Residences of Mining Boom Era, Park City - Thematic Nomination." National Register of Historic Places Inventory, Nomination Form. 1984.

## **4 ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION & INTEGRITY**

Building Type and/or Style: Rectangular block type

No. Stories: 2 1/2

Additions: Inone I minor I major (describe below) Alterations: I none I minor I major (describe below)

Number of associated outbuildings and/or structures: □ accessory building(s), # \_\_\_\_\_; □ structure(s), # \_\_\_\_\_. General Condition of Exterior Materials: ☑ Good (Well maintained with no serious problems apparent.)

□ Fair (Some problems are apparent. Describe the problems.):

Describe the problems are apparent and constitute an imminent threat. Describe the problems.):

□ Uninhabitable/Ruin

Materials (The physical elements that were combined or deposited during a particular period of time in a particular pattern or configuration. Describe the materials.):

Foundation: Stone and concrete.

Walls: Drop siding.

Roof: Clipped gable roof form.

Windows: Paired double-hung sash type.

Location: Original Location Original Location:

Design (The combination of physical elements that create the form, plan, space, structure, and style. Describe additions and/or alterations from the original design, including dates--known or estimated--when alterations were made): The 2 ½-story boarding house remains virtually unchanged from the description in the National Register nomination (see Structure/Site Information Form, 1983). The site has been rehabilitated and is in better condition than when the NR nomination was completed. The site retains its original design integrity.

Setting (The physical environment--natural or manmade--of a historic site. Describe the setting and how it has changed over time.): The setting has not been significantly altered from what is described in the National Register nomination and is seen on Sanborn Insurance maps.

Workmanship (The physical evidence of the crafts of a particular culture or people during a given period in history. Describe the distinctive elements.): The physical evidence from the period that defines this as a typical Park City mining era boarding house are the simple methods of construction, the use of non-beveled (drop-novelty) wood siding, the plan type, the simple roof form, the informal landscaping, the restrained ornamentation, and the plain finishes.

Feeling (Describe the property's historic character.): The physical elements of the site, in combination, convey a sense of life in a western mining town of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

Association (Describe the link between the important historic era or person and the property.): This structure is one of the remaining boarding houses built following passage of the boarding house bill in 1901.

This site was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1984 as part of the *Park City Mining Boom Era Residences Thematic District*. It was built within the historic period, defined as 1872 to1929 in the district nomination, and retains its historic integrity. As a result, it meets the criteria set forth in LMC Chapter 15-11 for designation as a Landmark Site.

### **5 SIGNIFICANCE**

Architect: ☑ Not Known □ Known: (source: )

Builder: ☑ Not Known □ Known: (source:)

Date of Construction: 1904<sup>1</sup>

Summit County Recorder.

The site must represent an important part of the history or architecture of the community. A site need only be significant under one of the three areas listed below:

1. Historic Era:

- □ Settlement & Mining Boom Era (1868-1893)
- ☑ Mature Mining Era (1894-1930)
- □ Mining Decline & Emergence of Recreation Industry (1931-1962)

Park City was the center of one of the top three metal mining districts in the state during Utah's mining boom period of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, and it is one of only two major metal mining communities that have survived to the present. Park City's houses are the largest and best-preserved group of residential buildings in a metal mining town in Utah. As such, they provide the most complete documentation of the residential character of mining towns of that period, including their settlement patterns, building materials, construction techniques, and socio-economic make-up. The residences also represent the state's largest collection of nineteenth and early twentieth century frame houses. They contribute to our understanding of a significant aspect of Park City's economic growth and architectural development as a mining community.<sup>2</sup>

2. Persons (Describe how the site is associated with the lives of persons who were of historic importance to the community or those who were significant in the history of the state, region, or nation):

3. Architecture (Describe how the site exemplifies noteworthy methods of construction, materials or craftsmanship used during the historic period or is the work of a master craftsman or notable architect):

## 6 PHOTOS

Digital color photographs are on file with the Planning Department, Park City Municipal Corp.

Photo No. 1: Southeast oblique. Camera facing northwest, 2008.
Photo No. 2: East elevation. Camera facing west, 2008.
Photo No. 3: Northeast oblique. Camera facing southwest, 2008.
Photo No. 4: East elevation. Camera facing west, 2006.
Photo No. 5: Southeast oblique. Camera facing northwest, 2006.
Photo No. 6: Southeast oblique. Camera facing northwest, 1995.

Photo No. 7: East elevation. Camera facing west, 1983.

Photo No. 8: East elevation. Camera facing west, 1983.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> From "Residences of Mining Boom Era, Park City - Thematic Nomination" written by Roger Roper, 1984.

PC 193 and the Location \_ Kind of Bldg. APARTMENT St., No. 221 Main Type 1 2 3 4. Cost \$ 2-2078 x\_\_\_ Class 4 (RES) Rms. Totals Factor Cu. Ft. Sq. Ft. Dimensions Stories 2557 1247 х x 1 1537 2078 x x 2 x x 408 Walls Stone Roof Conc Arr. Gar. 12 x 14 Flr. dut 2 Description of Building Additions Owner Foundation- Stone Conc. None\_ and Ext. Walls NU-LAP ON SIDING one Ernant Insulation- Floors \_\_\_\_\_Walls \_\_\_\_\_Clgs. Roof Type gable-deck Mrl. Slig only Dormers- Small\_\_\_\_\_ Med.\_\_\_\_ Large\_ NO ONE Bays- Small\_\_\_\_\_ Med.\_\_\_\_ Large 174" @ 150 261 Porches - Front\_\_\_\_\_ @\_ Rear LiveIN Basement Entr. @ @\_ THIS AND Planters \_\_\_\_ 70 Cellar-Bsmt. - 1/4 1/3 1/2 2/3 3/4 Full \_\_\_\_ Floor\_durt COULDN 14 Bsmt. Apt. \_\_\_\_\_ Rooms Fin. \_\_\_\_ Unfin. \_\_ Attic Rooms Fin. Unfin.\_\_\_ UNLESS 350 Class Tub 3 Trays 250 Basin 3 Sink 7 Toilet Extentive 250 Urls.\_\_\_\_\_ Ftns.\_\_\_\_\_ Shr.\_\_\_ Plumbing Rem. 15 Dishwasher \_\_\_\_\_Garbage Disp. Heat- Stove H.A. Steam Stkr. Blr. done 710 Oil \_\_\_\_ Gas \_\_\_\_ Coal \_\_\_\_ Pipeless \_\_\_\_\_ Radiant Air Cond.\_\_\_\_ SALVAGE Finish- Fir\_\_\_\_\_Hd. Wd.\_\_\_\_ Floor- Fir\_\_\_\_\_ Hd. Wd.\_\_\_\_Other\_ AT\$ 200 00 xax 240 Cabinets \_\_\_\_\_ Mantels\_\_\_\_\_ Blt. In \_\_ 10-24-68 Tile- Walls\_\_\_\_\_Floors Electrical- Outlets\_\_\_\_\_Fixt.\_\_ Storm Sash- Wood\_\_\_\_ Metal\_\_\_\_ Doors\_\_\_\_ Sash Metal Awnings \_\_\_\_\_ 2291 Total Additions Year Built 1891 Avg. Reproduction Value Depr. Col. (1) 2 3 4 5 6 30% Age 200 Owner . Tenant . Repr. Val. Minus Depr. Inf. by 2.0% Neighbor - Record - Est. Obsol. or Rem. 1760 Bldg. Value Remodel Year Est. Cost Garage- Class\_\_\_\_ Depr. 2% 3% \_\_\_\_ Roof\_\_\_\_ Doors. Cars Floor Walls Size\_\_\_\_\_ X \_\_\_\_ Age\_\_\_\_\_ Cost\_\_\_\_\_ x % Other\_\_ **Total Building Value** Page 13 of 27 Historic Preservation Board Packet November 4, 2015 1957 By 1331

Appraised 12-9



Page 14 of 27

## Property Type:

Utah State Historical Society

fac 5/29/84

Site No.

**Historic Preservation Research Office** 

## Structure/Site Information Form

Street Address:	etAddress: 221 <sub>Main</sub> Park City, Summit County, Utah		UTN	UTM: 12 458250 4498840		
Name of Structure:	Bogan Boarding House	Juniy, Juan	Т.	R.	S.	
Present Owner:	Linda and Dale M. Ne	lson				
Owner Address:	4240 South 1300 East	, Salt Lake Ci	ty, UT 84117			
Year Built(Tax Reco Legal Description		ive Age: f Building:		Tax#: PC 193		
North 5 feet of Lot 5 and all of Lot 6 Block 23 Park City Survey Less than one acre.						
Original Owner: Jo	hn & Anna Bogan	Constructio	n Date: c. 19(	)4 Demolition [	Date:	
Original Use: boa	rding house	Present Use	: Lodging			
Building Condition:	Integrity:	Preliminary Eva	luation:	Final Register S	tatus:	
□ Excellent □ Site <del>□ G</del> ood □ Rui □ Deteriorated		<b>₽-S</b> ignificant □ Contributory □ Not Contributory	<ul> <li>Not of the Historic Period</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>National Landmark</li> <li>National Register</li> <li>State Register</li> </ul>	G District G Multi-Resource G Thematic	
 Photography:	Date of Slides:	Slide No.:	Date of Photog	graphs:	Photo No.:	
Views:	🗆 Front 🗆 Side 🗆 Rear 🗆 Other	Vie	ws: 🗆 Front 🗆 Side	🗆 Rear 🗆 Other		
<b>Research Sources:</b>						
Abstract of Title	🖆 - <del>Sa</del> nborn Maps	Newspapers		U of U Library		
Plat Records/Map	City Directories	Utah State Histor	•	BYU Library		
Tax Card & Photo	Biographical Encyclopedias	Personal Interview		USU Library		
Building Permit	E-Obiturary Index	LDS Church Arc		SLC Library		
Sewer Permit	Gounty & City Histories	LDS Genealogic	al Society	Other		

Bibliographical References (books, articles, records, interviews, old photographs and maps, etc.):

Park Record. March 30, 1901, p. 3; April 6, 1901, p. 3; April 13, 1907, John Bogan obituary

Street Address:	221 Main	Site No:
Architect/Builder:	unknown	
Building Materials:	Wood	
Building Type/Style:	Boarding House	

Description of physical appearance & significant architectural features: (Include additions, alterations, ancillary structures, and landscaping if applicable)

This building is a two and one half story frame rectangular boarding house with a clipped gable roof. The first floor is raised up above street level, fronted by a stone base through which the front stairs are cut, and into which shops were created at the street level. Drop siding is the principal building material, but there is narrow lap siding on the gable section. When the roof was replaced in 1940 because of a fire, the gable section was re-sided, and it is probable that lap siding was the most readily available material. The building exhibits no particular style, but has the standard elements common to a majority of Park City houses. There is a two story porch constructed of lathe turned piers topped by simple jigsaw cut brackets. A simple straight post balustrade encloses the second story porch. Above the two center piers is a simple decortaive pediment. The arrangement of openings on the facade is symmetrical and essentially identical for the first two floors. A door is centered between paired double hung windows. The doors and windows are the long, narrow Victorian type, the doors being topped by a transom. There is also a pair of windows centered in the gable end of the top half story. There are several simple openings on the sides of the building, and there is a one story rear extension. The extension appears on the 1907 Sanborn Insurance Map and is probably original. The only alterations to the exterior of the (See continuation sheet)

Statement of Historical Significance:

Construction Date: c. 1904

Built c. 1904, this boarding house at 221 Main is historically significant as one of only four extant boarding houses which were built in town after the passage of the mine boarding houses in the entire Park City area to have survived to the present. Because miners were required to live in boarding houses close to the mines unless they were married with families in Park City, the greatest number of boarding houses were built up the various canyons, close to the mines. A 1901 bill, however, revoked the right of mine management to require men to live in the boarding houses. At that time this boarding house and others were built in Park City proper to accommodate the influx of single miners. None of the boarding houses that were built close to the mines have survived, and only four are extant in Park City, therefore this building is especially significant as one of the four early boarding houses that document this type of residential accommodation.

This boarding house was built around 1904 for John and Anna Bogan, who owned it for several years. John Bogan was a miner and owner of the Bogan Mine, which later became part of the rich Silver King Consolidated Mine. He had come from Illinois to Utah around 1877 and worked in the mines at Alta and Dry Fork before coming to Park City around 1879. John Bogan died in 1907 at the age of 62 and Anna died in 1919. This property remained with their sons John T. and James F. Bogan until around 1925.

This was one of several large boarding houses constructed in the town after the passage of a bill in 1901 which revoked the right of the mines' managements to require that their miners live in the boarding houses near the mines if they were not married or their families were not living in town with HithAmbreseTheonboard diage thouses anear the mines, though convenient for workage wearer (See continuation sheet) 221 Main Description continued:

building include the addition of a cinderblock chimney and a small window to the south facade, and a metal balustrade to the first floor porch section. Those changes are minor, however, and do not affect the building's original character.

History continued:

considered the poorest accommodations available, and many miners moved into the new boarding houses in town after 1901.<sup>1</sup> This building served primarily as a boarding house for miners, but during the 1918 flu epidemic it was used as an emergency hospital. It is currently known as the Imperial Boarding House, and is still in use as a lodging house.

<sup>1</sup>Park Record, March 30, 1901, p. 3; April 6, 1901, p. 3.



```
Bogan Boarding House
221 Main
Park City, Summit County, Utah
```

East facade

Photo by Roger Roper, October 1983 Negative: Utah State Historical Society



```
Bogan Boarding House
221 Main
Park City, Summit County, Utah
```

East facade

Photo by Roger Roper, October 1983 Negative: Utah State Historical Society











