

Historic Preservation Board Staff Report

Planning Department

Author:	Laura Newberry, Planning Technician
	Anya Grahn, Historic Preservation Planner
Subject:	Material Deconstruction and Reconstruction Review
Address:	835 Empire Avenue
Project Number:	PL-17-03556
Date:	May 16, 2018
Type of Item:	Administrative – Material Deconstruction and Reconstruction

Summary Recommendation:

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board review and discuss the application, conduct a public hearing, and approve the material deconstruction of non-historic and non-contributory materials at 835 Empire Avenue pursuant to the following findings of fact, conclusions of law, and conditions of approval. This site is designated as Landmark on the City's Historic Sites Inventory (HSI).

Topic:

Address:	835 Empire Avenue
Designation:	Landmark
Applicant:	Regis McHugh, represented by Architect Jonathan Degray
Proposal:	Material Deconstruction on Landmark Site. The applicant is proposing to impact the following materials including the contemporary wood retaining wall; non-historic wood landscape steps; post-1941 rear additions; non-historic 1997 asphalt shingle and rolled asphalt roofing materials; non-historic concrete block foundation; pre-1983 wraparound porch; four (4) historic wood doors; and ten (10) historic wood windows.

Background:

On March 5, 2018, the Planning Department received a Historic District Design Review (HDDR) application for the property at 835 Empire Avenue. The application was deemed complete on March 8, 2018. The Historic District Design Review (HDDR) application has not yet been approved, as it is dependent on Historic Preservation Board's (HPB) Review for Material Deconstruction approval and the request for a remodel and addition to a Landmark Site.

History of Development on this Site

This house was likely constructed in 1895, but the exact date of construction and the original owner is unknown. The Historic Site Form finds that the structure was originally built as a variant of the shot gun and hall-parlor house forms that were common during Park City's Mining Era (stretching from 1868 to 1930); however, the Historic Site Form has identified the Settlement and Mining Boom Era (1868-1893) as this site's era of historical significance.

The house first appears on the 1900 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map as a simple, 1.5 story house with one-story additions on the north (side) and west (rear) elevations. The

Sanborn Fire Insurance map indicates that it is a wood frame structure, facing east towards town. No porch is shown.



In 1905, James Gibson bought the house for \$75 at a special auction which involved the sale of over a dozen Park City houses. He and his wife, Emma, owned the property through 1947. They lived in the house continuously during that time, except for two years when James lived in Chicago around the time of the Columbian Exposition.

Between 1900 and 1907, the rear addition was removed and new additions were constructed in its place. This change is first documented by the 1907 Sanborn Fire Insurance map which shows a large, square addition on the northwest corner of the house. A smaller addition is built directly south of this addition, on the southwest corner of the house. The one-story addition along the north elevation shown in the 1900 Sanborn Fire Insurance map remains.

An accessory structure was also built, twenty feet (20') west from the rear of the house. Between 1929 and 1941, there was an addition to the accessory building, bringing it to fifteen feet (15') from the rear of the house. This accessory building has since been lost, and staff has not found documentation of when it was demolished.



The first photograph of this house was taken as part of the c.1941 tax assessment. The photograph shows a railroad tie retaining wall along the street, with wood steps leading up to the house. The 1.5 story shotgun house is visible with a shed-addition along the north side. A portion of the c.1907 rear addition with a door is also visible to the north of this addition.



C.1941 tax photograph

The Gibson's daughter, Miriam Tessman, owned the property from 1947 through 1964. Staff believes the additions on the west side of the house shown in the 1941 Sanborn Fire Insurance map were removed during Tessman's ownership and expanded. Tessman sold to Theo and Ruth Wood, who owned the property through 1971. At that time, Delmar and Beth Taylor purchased the house and were the owners until 2017.



1983 NRHP Reconaissance Survey Photograph

Sometime before 1983, a wraparound porch was added as well as a small shed extension from the main gable to the porch. In 1984, the house was nominated for the National Register but was not listed due to the owner's objection.

This property has received several Historic District Grants. On June 22, 1988, the Historic District Commission awarded then-owner Delmar Taylor a grant in the maximum amount of \$2,500 for a new foundation and repair of a wood retaining wall. In August of 1994, a grant in amount of \$3,000 was awarded to repair the roof and foundation, but the work was not completed in time so the grant was reallocated. The owner, Delmar Taylor, reapplied for the Historic District Grant in 1995 to reroof the house; the grant was approved, but the work was not completed. Delmar Taylor received a grant again 1997 in the amount of \$2,250.00 to repair the roof. In 1998, the work was completed and the grant funds were released to Mr. Taylor.

In 2017, the current owner purchased the home. The house remains largely unchanged from the 1984 National Register nomination form.

Material Deconstruction

The house has remained largely unchanged since the 1980s. The applicant is proposing to renovate the historic house and construct a new addition on the west (rear) elevation of the historic house. The following Material Deconstruction outlines the proposed scope of work:

1. SITE DESIGN

This site is an uphill lot. The c.1941 tax photograph shows a horizontal wood plank retaining wall along the street; however, this wall was removed by the 1980s and replaced with a new wood retaining wall. There are a set of wood steps that lead from the street up to the midpoint of the front yard. A stone walkway then extends from the steps to the porch. The landscaping is informal with no mature vegetation. These improvements are highlighted in red in the following image.

The applicant proposes to remove these non-historic improvements to the site in order to redevelop the site. The applicant proposes to re-grade the site and construct new stacked stone retaining walls where necessary. A new concrete walkway and stairs will be constructed. Staff finds that the proposed material deconstruction mitigates to the greatest extent practical any impact to the historical importance of other structures located on the property and on adjacent parcels. Further, these later additions to the site do not contribute to the historic integrity or historical significance of the site.



2. NON-HISTORIC ADDITIONS

Based on physical evidence, the applicant and staff have determined that two (2) additions were constructed on the west elevation of the historic house after the 1941 Sanborn Fire Insurance map. First, the small, rectangular addition on the southwest corner of the house was removed and a new square, stacked stone addition with a shed roof was built; this addition is used as a dining room. Later, the kitchen addition was expanded to the west to include a bathroom. Staff believes both of these additions were constructed after 1941 as they have concrete walls and were built into the hillside.

The applicant proposes to retain the historic kitchen addition, but remove these post-1941 additions. Staff finds that the proposed scope of work mitigates any impact that will occur to the historical significance of the house and any impact to the architectural integrity of the house. These additions do not contribute to the historic integrity of the house.



3. STRUCTURE

The house was originally constructed c.1985. The rear additions that include a portion of the kitchen and bathroom as well as the dining room were constructed of concrete after the 1941 Sanborn Fire Insurance map. A wraparound porch and a small shed extension from the main gable bay to the porch were added before 1983. The existing house is proposed to be stabilized, lifted, and temporarily placed on wood cribbing. The existing upper level floor framing is to be removed and a new floor structure constructed. The existing main level floor framing is to be inspected and repaired or replaced as needed.

The proposed interior changes will not damage or destroy the exterior architectural features of the subject property which are compatible with the character of the historic site and are not included in the proposed scope of work.

4. <u>ROOF</u>

The historic house has an east-west front-facing gable with historic shed additions to the north elevation. In 1997, the roofing material was covered with new three-tab asphalt shingles and rolled asphalt roofing. It is now in poor condition and needs to be replaced. The applicant is proposing to replace the roofing with new asphalt shingles. Additional structural members will be added on the interior of the historic roof form to improve its stability.

Staff finds the proposed scope of work mitigates any impacts that will occur to the historical significance of the house and any impact that will occur to the architectural integrity of the house.

5. EXTERIOR WALLS

The house is a wood framed structure clad in drop-novelty wood siding and corner boards. The exterior has plain trim, without ornamentation. A new foundation was constructed in 1988 and new wood siding was extended below the floor line of the exterior walls to cover it. The applicant proposes only to repair and replace rotted siding as necessary. Staff finds the proposed scope of work is routine maintenance (including repair or replacement where there is no change in the design, materials, or general appearance of the elements of the structure or grounds) and does not require Historic Preservation Board Review (HPBR).

Approximately 18.75 linear feet of the west elevation will be removed in order to accommodate the new addition. Staff finds the proposed exterior changes shall not damage or destroy the exterior architectural features of the subject property which are compatible with the character of the historic site and are not included in the proposed scope of work.

6. FOUNDATION

The applicant has not been able to verify the condition of the slab foundation that is believed to have been constructed in 1988; however, they have found evidence of a concrete block foundation located at the back of the house along the bathroom and kitchen addition.

The applicant is proposing to replace the existing foundation with a new concrete basement foundation. The basement foundation will include a garage, accessible from the street. The proposed exterior changes will not damage or destroy the exterior architectural features of the subject property which are compatible with the character of the historic site and are not included in the proposed scope of work.

Staff has added the usual Conditions of Approval to ensure to protection of the historic house while the foundation is constructed:

#2. The Preservation Plan must include a cribbing and excavation stabilization shoring plan reviewed and stamped by a State of Utah licensed and registered structural engineer prior to issuance of a building permit. Cribbing or shoring must be of engineer specified materials. Screw-type jacks for raising and lowering the building are not allowed as primary supports once the building is lifted.

#3. An encroachment agreement may be required prior to issuance of a building permit for projects utilizing soils nails that encroach onto neighboring properties.

#4. A Soils Report completed by a geotechnical engineer as well as a temporary shoring plan, if applicable, will be required at the time of building permit application.

#5. Within five (5) days of installation of the cribbing and shoring, the structural engineer will inspect and approve the cribbing and shoring as constructed.

#6. Historic buildings which are lifted off the foundation must be returned to the completed foundation within 45 days of the date the building permit was issued.

#7. The Planning Director may make a written determination to extend this period up to 30 additional days if, after consultation with the Historic Preservation Planner, Chief Building Official, and City Engineer, he determines that it is necessary. This would be based upon the need to immediately stabilize an existing Historic property, or specific site conditions such as access, or lack thereof, exist, or in an effort to reduce impacts on adjacent properties.

#8. The applicant is responsible for notifying the Building Department if changes are made. If the cribbing and/or shoring plan(s) are to be altered at any time during the construction of the foundation by the contractor, the structural engineer shall submit a new cribbing and/or shoring plan for review. The structural engineer shall be required to re-inspect and approve the cribbing and/or shoring alterations within five (5) days of any relocation or alteration to the cribbing and/or shoring.

#9 The applicant shall also request an inspection through the Building Department following the modification to the cribbing and/or shoring. Failure to request the inspection will be a violation of the Preservation Plan and enforcement action through the financial guarantee for historic preservation or ACE could take place.

2. <u>PORCH</u>

There is a non-historic wraparound porch on the northeast corner of the house, added sometime before 1983. While staff has not found evidence that this porch existed before 1983, it is a feature that would have been typical during the historic period. Further, it does not detract from the historical significance of the site. As noted in the National Register nomination for this house, "The porch is not original, but it was designed to complement the building and does not affect its original character."

The applicant is proposing to reconstruct the c.1983 porch to comply with building codes. Staff finds that the proposed reconstruction of the non-historic porch will mitigate any impacts that will occur to the historical significance of the house or any impact that will occur to the architectural integrity of the house.



3. DOORS

There are a total of four (4) historic doors on the house. One door is located on the north elevation, on the original shot-gun portion of the house; the applicant is proposing to reconstruct it as a faux door. The second door is located on the shed addition and faces the street. The third door is located on the shed addition containing the kitchen at the rear of the house. The applicant proposes to reconstruct Door #2 and #3. The fourth door is located on the second story of the west elevation. It may have been used to access the backyard historically; however, it today it walks out onto the shed roof of the dining room addition. This door is proposed to be removed as it will be blocked by the new addition. These doors are highlighted in red below.



Staff finds that these doors are in varying degrees of disrepair due to age and general wear and tear. Staff finds that replacement may be necessary in order to restore the historic wood paneled doors; however, any replacements should be made in-kind. Staff has added the following Condition of Approval to address the replacement:

#10. Replacement doors shall exactly match the historic door in size, material, profile, and style.

4. WINDOWS

There are a total of ten (10) historic wood windows on the house. The Physical Conditions Report notes they are in good condition; however, the applicant would like to replace them with new energy efficient wood windows. The windows on the west elevation will be blocked by the new addition and the window beneath the porch on the north elevation will be replaced with a new patio door.

Staff finds that the historic wood windows may be restored in order to meet energy standards. Staff has added the following Conditions of Approval to ensure that every effort is made to not discard historic materials unnecessarily:

#11. An independent window evaluation specialist will assess and report on the existing window conditions and outline options for rehabilitation or replacement in satisfaction of the Planning Director.

#12. Should the original wood windows not be able to be restored, the replacement windows shall exactly match the historic window in size, dimensions, glazing pattern, depth, profile, and material.

Staff finds that the replacement of the north window beneath the porch with a new French door is appropriate as it is beyond the midpoint of the historic structure and

will not be visible from the right-of-way (highlighted in red below). Staff finds the proposed exterior changes shall not damage or destroy the exterior architectural features of the subject property which are compatible with the character of the historic site and are not included in the proposed scope of work.



Recommendation:

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board review and discuss the application, conduct a public hearing, and approve the material deconstruction of non-historic and non-contributory materials at 835 Empire Avenue pursuant to the following findings of fact, conclusions of law, and conditions of approval. This site is designated as Landmark on the City's Historic Sites Inventory (HSI).

Finding of Fact:

- 1. The property is located at 835 Empire Avenue.
- 2. The site is designated as Landmark on the Historic Sites Inventory.
- 3. On March 5, 2018, the Planning Department received a Historic District Design Review (HDDR) application for the property at 835 Empire Avenue; it was deemed complete March 8, 2018. The HDDR application has not yet been approved as it is dependent on the HPB's Review for Material Deconstruction approval.
- 4. The house was likely constructed c.1895 as a variant of the shotgun and hall-parlor style houses constructed during the Mining Era. It is only one of three examples of extant historic houses that are exemptions to Park City's standard historic house types.
- 5. The Historic Site Form has identified this site era of historical significance as the Settlement and Mining Boom Era (1868-1893).
- 6. The house first appears on the 1900 Sanborn Fire Insurance map as a simple 1-1/2 story house with one-story addition on the north and west elevations. It faced east toward town. No porch is shown on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps.
- 7. Between 1900 and 1907, the rear addition was removed and new additions were constructed in its place. This change is first documented by the 1907 Sanborn Fire Insurance map.
- 8. The first photograph of the house was taken as part of the c.1941 tax assessment. The photograph shows a railroad tie retaining wall along the street with wood

landscape steps built into the grade. The front-gable shotgun house along with the north addition and c.1907 rear addition are visible in the photograph.

- 9. Under the ownership of Miriam Tessman, additions along the west elevation were removed and new additions were constructed to expand the interior of the house. On the southwest side of the house, the dining room addition is constructed of stacked stone and built into the hillside. On the northeast side of the house, the addition has a shed roof concrete walls; this area contains a portion of the bathroom and kitchen.
- 10. Sometime before 1983, a wraparound porch was added with a small shed extension from the main gable to the porch.
- 11. In 1984, the house was nominated to the National Register of Historic Places but was not listed due to the owner's objection.
- 12. The property has received several Historic Districts Grants. In June 1988, the Historic District Commission (HDC) awarded a grant in the amount of \$2,500 for a new foundation and repair of the wood retaining wall. They awarded a second grant in August 1994 for \$3,000 for the repair of the roof and the foundation, but the work was not completed in time and the grant was reallocated. In 1995, the owner received grant funds to reroof the house; however, the work was not completed in 1998.
- 13. The applicant proposes to remove the existing wood plank retaining wall, wood steps, and stone walkway. The material deconstruction involved in re-grading the site and adding new landscape elements mitigates to the greatest extent practical any impact to the historical importance of the house located on the property and on adjacent parcels. These later additions to the site do not contribute to its historical integrity or historical significance.
- 14. Based on physical evidence, the applicant has demonstrated that two additions were constructed on the west elevation of the historic house after 1941. These additions are proposed to be removed and replaced with a new, larger addition. The proposed scope of work mitigates any impact that will occur to the historical significance of the house and impact to the architectural integrity of the house.
- 15. The applicant proposes to reconstruct the second floor structure from the interior and add new framed walls on the interior, where necessary. The proposed interior changes will not damage or destroy the exterior architectural features of the subject property which are compatible with the character of the historic site and are not included in the proposed scope of work.
- 16. The roof is covered with non-historic three-tab asphalt shingle and rolled roofing. The applicant proposes to restructure the roof from the interior and replace the exterior roofing materials. The proposed scope of work mitigates any impacts that will occur to the historical significance of the house and any impact that will occur to the architectural integrity of the house.
- 17. The applicant only proposes to repair and replace rotted siding where necessary. The proposed scope of work is routine maintenance (including repair or replacement where there is no change in the design, materials, or general appearance of the elements of the structure or grounds) and does not require Historic Preservation Board Review.
- 18. Approximately 18.8 linear feet of the west elevation will be removed in order to accommodate the new addition. The proposed exterior changes shall not damage

or destroy the exterior architectural features of the subject property which are compatible with the character of the historic site and are not included in the proposed scope of work.

- 19. The applicant has not been able to verify the condition of the slab foundation that is believed to have been constructed in 1988. The applicant proposes to replace the existing slab foundation with a new concrete basement foundation that will include a basement-level garage. The proposed exterior changes will not damage or destroy exterior architectural features of the subject property which are compatible with the character of the historic site and are not included in the proposed scope of work.
- 20. There is a non-historic wraparound porch along the north and east sides of the house that was added before 1983. While the porch is not historic, it was designed to complement the building and does not affect its original character. The applicant is proposing to reconstruct the porch. The reconstruction will mitigate any impacts that will occur to the historical significance of the house or any impact that will occur to the architectural integrity of the house.
- 21. There are four (4) historic doors on the house. The applicant proposes to reconstruct these doors on the north and east elevations. The door on the west elevation will be covered by the new addition. The material deconstruction is necessary in order to restore the historic wood paneled doors and the replacements will be in-kind.
- 22. There are a total of 10 historic wood, double-hung windows on the house. The applicant's Physical Conditions Report notes they are in good condition; however, the applicant proposes to replace them with new energy efficient wood windows. The windows on the west elevation will be blocked by the new addition. The material deconstruction associated with the historic wood windows is necessary in order to restore the historic house.
- 23. The applicant proposes to replace an existing wood window on the north elevation beneath the porch with a new French door. The window is located beyond the midpoint of the historic house and will not be visible from the right-of-way. The proposed exterior change will not damage or destroy the exterior architectural features of the subject property which are compatible with the character of the historic site and are not included in the proposed scope of work.

Conclusions of Law:

- 1. The proposal complies with the Land Management Code requirements pursuant to the HR-1 District and regarding historic structure deconstruction and reconstruction.
- 2. The proposal meets the criteria for material deconstruction pursuant to LMC 15-11-12.5 Historic Preservation Board Review for Material Deconstruction.

Conditions of Approval:

- 1. Final building plans and construction details shall reflect substantial compliance with the HDDR proposal stamped in on October 14, 2016. Any changes, modifications, or deviations from the approved design that have not been approved by the Planning and Building Departments may result in a stop work order.
- 2. The Preservation Plan must include a cribbing and excavation stabilization shoring plan reviewed and stamped by a State of Utah licensed and registered structural engineer prior to issuance of a building permit. Cribbing or shoring must be of

engineer specified materials. Screw-type jacks for raising and lowering the building are not allowed as primary supports once the building is lifted.

- 3. An encroachment agreement may be required prior to issuance of a building permit for projects utilizing soils nails that encroach onto neighboring properties.
- 4. A Soils Report completed by a geotechnical engineer as well as a temporary shoring plan, if applicable, will be required at the time of building permit application.
- 5. Within five (5) days of installation of the cribbing and shoring, the structural engineer will inspect and approve the cribbing and shoring as constructed.
- 6. Historic buildings which are lifted off the foundation must be returned to the completed foundation within 45 days of the date the building permit was issued.
- 7. The Planning Director may make a written determination to extend this period up to 30 additional days if, after consultation with the Historic Preservation Planner, Chief Building Official, and City Engineer, he determines that it is necessary. This would be based upon the need to immediately stabilize an existing Historic property, or specific site conditions such as access, or lack thereof, exist, or in an effort to reduce impacts on adjacent properties.
- 8. The applicant is responsible for notifying the Building Department if changes are made. If the cribbing and/or shoring plan(s) are to be altered at any time during the construction of the foundation by the contractor, the structural engineer shall submit a new cribbing and/or shoring plan for review. The structural engineer shall be required to re-inspect and approve the cribbing and/or shoring alterations within five (5) days of any relocation or alteration to the cribbing and/or shoring.
- 9. The applicant shall also request an inspection through the Building Department following the modification to the cribbing and/or shoring. Failure to request the inspection will be a violation of the Preservation Plan and enforcement action through the financial guarantee for historic preservation or ACE could take place.
- 10. Replacement doors shall exactly match the historic door in size, material, profile, and style.
- 11. An independent window evaluation specialist will assess and report on the existing window conditions and outline options for rehabilitation or replacement in satisfaction of the Planning Director.
- 12. Should the original wood windows not be able to be restored, the replacement windows shall exactly match the historic window in size, dimensions, glazing pattern, depth, profile, and material.

Exhibits:

Exhibit A – HPB Checklist for Material Deconstruction

- Exhibit B <u>Historic Sites Inventory Form</u>
- Exhibit C Updated Plans, dated October 14, 2016
- Exhibit D Physical Conditions Report + Historic Preservation Plan

Historic Preservation Board Material Deconstruction Review Checklist:

- 1. Routine Maintenance (including repair or replacement where there is no change in the design, materials, or general appearance of the elements of the structure or grounds) does not require Historic Preservation Board Review (HPBR).
- 2. The material deconstruction is required for the renovation, restoration, or rehabilitation of the building, structure, or object.
- 3. Proposed exterior changes shall not damage or destroy the exterior architectural features of the subject property which are compatible with the character of the historic site and are not included in the proposed scope of work.
- 4. The proposed scope of work mitigates any impacts that will occur to the visual character of the neighborhood where material deconstruction is proposed to occur; any impacts that will occur to the historical significance of the buildings, structures, or objects located on the property; any impact that will occur to the architectural integrity of the buildings, structures, or objects located on the property; and any impact that will compromise the structural stability of the historic building.
- 5. The proposed scope of work mitigates to the greatest extent practical any impact to the historical importance of other structures located on the property and on adjacent parcels.
- 6. Any addition to a Historic Building, Site, or Structure has been found to be non-contributory to the historic integrity or historical significance of the structure or site.

Exhibit		Pedan DeGray r c h i t e c t A c h m su c nor c nor c nor c nor r c h m su c nor c nor c nor c nor nor r c f h m su c nor c nor c nor	A 81 x08 .0.9	by by K CLLX ² 0.1 84060 832 EVBLIEE VALME MeHOCH BESIDENCE	T	AA AA BEET REXERTING COVER SHEE
	McHUGH RESIDENCE 835 EMPIRE AVENUE PARK CITY, UT 84060 HISTORIC DISTRICT DESIGN REVIEW SET	CONSULTANTS AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND	CODE ANALYSIS INDEX TO DRAWINGS	の16 (K 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 <th0< th=""> 0 <th0< th=""> <th0< td="" th0<=""><td>GENERAL NOTES</td><td>1. THIS DESIGN IS A LORGINAL LIVERHEBED WARK AND MAY AN</td></th0<></th0<></th0<>	GENERAL NOTES	1. THIS DESIGN IS A LORGINAL LIVERHEBED WARK AND MAY AN
	Ŧ		LEGEN BRUCK & STONE	ARVINIT ALL ALL ALL ALL ALL ALL ALL ALL ALL AL	ABBREVIATIONS	MC MC coordination FD FLOORBAN PLO MR MR<





Jonathan DeGray A r c h i t e c t P. Det URL 41444644464.000 Tech 2000, 14444464
PROTOTING THE PROPERTIMAN TO A CHUCH RESIDENCE 835 EMPIRE AVENUE PARK CITY, UT 84060
RELEVEL PLAN ROOF LEVEL PLAN
REVISIONS: DATE 04/18/18 PROJECT NUMBER:
PROJECT NUMBER:
SHEET NUMBER: AB1.2





























	PHYSICAL CONDITIONS REPORT						
For Use with the Historic District Design Review (HDDR) Application							
PLANNER:	For Official Use Only APPLICATION #:						
PROJECT INFO NAME: ADDRESS:	DATE RECEIVED:						
TAX ID: SUBDIVISION: SURVEY: HISTORIC DES	SA-312 OR Snyder's Additon LOT #: 5 & South 1/2 of 6 BLOCK #: 30 IGNATION: I LANDMARK						
APPLICANT INI NAME: MAILING ADDRESS:	FORMATION Dr. Regis McHugh 151 Beech Valley Road Jennette, PA 15644						
PHONE #: EMAIL:	() - FAX #: () - regiswmchugh@gmail.com						
APPLICANT'S F NAME:	REPRESENTATIVE INFORMATION Jonathan DeGray						
PHONE #: EMAIL:	(435) 649 - 7263 degrayarch@qwestoffice.net						

If you have questions regarding the requirements on this application or process please contact a member of the Park City Planning Staff at (435) 615-5060 or visit us online at www.parkcity.org. Updated 10/2014.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RESPONSIBILITY

This is to certify that I am making an application for the described action by the City and that I am responsible for complying with all City requirements with regard to this request. This application should be processed in my name and I am a party whom the City should contact regarding any matter pertaining to this application.

I have read and understood the instructions supplied by Park City for processing this application. The documents and/or information I have submitted are true and correct to the best of my knowledge. I understand that my application is not deemed complete until a Project Planner has reviewed the application and has notified me that it has been deemed complete.

I will keep myself informed of the deadlines for submission of material and the progress of this application. I understand that a staff report will be made available for my review three days prior to any public hearings or public meetings. This report will be on file and available at the Planning Department in the Marsac Building.

I further understand that additional fees may be charged for the City's review of the proposal. Any additional analysis required would be processed through the City's consultants with an estimate of time/expense provided prior to an authorization with the study.

Signature of Applicant							
Name of Applicant:	Dr. R	egis Mo	Hugh				
Mailing	151 I	Beech '	√alley Rd.				
Address:	Jennette, PA 15644						
Phone #:	()	-	Fax #: ()	-	
Email:	regis	wmchu	gh@gmail.com				
Type of Application:	HDD	R					

AFFIRMATION OF SUFFICIENT INTEREST

I hereby affirm that I am the fee title owner of the below described property or that I have written authorization from the owner to pursue the described action. I further affirm that I am aware of the City policy that no application will be accepted nor work performed for properties that are tax delinquent.

Name of Owner: Dr. Regis McHugh	
Mailing Address: 151 Beech Valley Rd.	
Jennette, PA 15644	
Street Address/ Legal SA-312, 835 Empire Ave.	
Description of Subject Property: Single Family Residence	

Signature:

Date:

1. If you are not the fee owner attach a copy of your authorization to pursue this action provided by the fee owner.

- 2. If a corporation is fee titleholder, attach copy of the resolution of the Board of Directors authorizing the action.
- 3. If a joint venture or partnership is the fee owner, attach a copy of agreement authorizing this action on behalf of the joint venture or partnership
- 4. If a Home Owner's Association is the applicant than the representative/president must attaché a notarized letter stating they have notified the owners of the proposed application. A vote should be taken prior to the submittal and a statement of the outcome provided to the City along with the statement that the vote meets the requirements set forth in the CC&Rs.

Please note that this affirmation is not submitted in lieu of sufficient title evidence. You will be required to submit a title opinion, certificate of title, or title insurance policy showing your interest in the property prior to Final Action.

If you have questions regarding the requirements on this application or process please contact a member of the Park City Planning Staff at (435) 615-5060 or visit us online at www.parkcity.org. Updated 10/2014.

PHYSICAL CONDITIONS REPORT

Detailed Description of Existing Conditions. Use this page to describe all existing conditions. Number items consecutively to describe all conditions, including building exterior, additions, site work, landscaping, and new construction. Provide supplemental pages of descriptions as necessary for those items not specifically outlined below.

1. Site Design

This section should address landscape features such as stone retaining walls, hillside steps, and fencing. Existing landscaping and site grading as well as parking should also be documented. Use as many boxes as necessary to describe the physical features of the site. Supplemental pages should be used to describe additional elements and features.

Element/Feature	Site					
This involves:	An original partA later addition	0	Estimated date of	construction: <u>V</u>	'aries	_
Describe existing fe	eature:					
The site slopes dow	n from the rear prope	rty line at west to I	Empire avenue at ea	st.		
	vooden boards held wi arly as the c. 1940 tax		n ties is located at fro	nt of site This reta	aining wall app	bears
A set of wooden ste	ps leads from the finis	hed road grade to	midpoint in the front	yard.		
The house sits near built into the hill at the	ly eight feet above the ne back of the lot.	finished road gra	de on approximately	0.06 acres. The r	ear additions	are
Landscaping is infor of similar size and s	rmal and includes lawr cale.	n and deciduous a	nd evergreen trees.	The home is sur	rounded by ho	ouse
Describe any defici	encies:	Existing Condit	ion: 🗌 Excellent	□ Good	E Fair] Poor
Photo Numbers: 1	0-21, 25		stration Numbers:	1, 5-8		

If you have questions regarding the requirements on this application or process please contact a member of the Park City Planning Staff at (435) 615-5060 or visit us online at www.parkcity.org. Updated 10/2014.

2. Structure

Use this section to describe the general structural system of the building including floor and ceiling systems as well as the roof structure. Supplemental pages should be used to describe additional elements and features.

Element/Feature	"Structure						
This involves:	An original part of the buildingA later addition	Estimated date of construction:	Varies				
Describe existing feature:							
The original stru	ucture was built circa 1895						

The house remains largely unchanged from the description in the National Register nomination form completed in 1984 (see USHS Structure/Site Form).

Alterations include the addition of the wrap around porch and small shed extension from the main gable bay to the porch. This porch was added before 1983. The rear additions, built into the hill at the rear of the lot, appear on the 1900 Sanborn map and are assumed to be original.

Describe any deficiencies:	Existing Condition:	Excellent	Good	🗌 Fair	Poor
			<u> </u>		
Photo Numbers: 9-15, 17-26) Illustra	tion Numbers:	2-8		

If you have questions regarding the requirements on this application or process please contact a member of the Park City Planning Staff at (435) 615-5060 or visit us online at www.parkcity.org. Updated 10/2014.

3. Roof

Use this section to describe the roofing system, flashing, drainage such as downspouts and gutters, skylights, chimneys, and other rooftop features. Supplemental pages should be used to describe additional elements and features.

Element/Feature	Roof					
This involves:	An original partA later addition	of the building	Estimated date of	construction:	Varies	5
Describe existing fe	eature:					
Roofing materia Roofing materia	ble form with sev al at main gable a al at all other roof poor condition an	nd mechanica areas is rolled	al dormer is 3 ta d asphalt.		ningle.	
Describe any defici	encies:	Existing Condit	ion:	□ Good	Fair	Poor
Photo Numbers: 9	-11, 13, 17,	25-26 IIIu	stration Numbers:	4, 5-8		
4. Chimney

Use this section to describe any existing chimneys. One box should be devoted to each existing chimney. Supplemental pages should be used to describe additional elements and features.

Element/Feature	<u>Mechanic</u>	al Flues				
This involves:	An original partA later addition	t of the building	stimated date of	construction:	Unkno	own
Describe existing fe	ature:					
Mechanical app	asonry chimneys bliance flues are l sing gable and at	located at the me		ner on the n	orth facin	g slope
Describe any defici	encies:	Existing Condition	: 🗌 Excellent	Good	🗌 Fair	Poor

Photo Numbers: 17, 26

Illustration Numbers:

5. Exterior Walls

Use this section to describe exterior wall construction, finishes, and masonry. Be sure to also document other exterior elements such as porches and porticoes separately. Must include descriptions of decorative elements such as corner boards, fascia board, and trim. Supplemental pages should be used to describe additional elements and features.

Element/Feature:	Exterior V	Valls				
This involves:	An original partA later addition	of the building	Estimated date of	construction:	Varies	
Describe existing fea	ature:					
East (Front) Facade The exterior walls are wood framed and clad in non-beveled (drop-novelty) wood siding and corner boards. Window and door trim is wood without ornamentation.						
Drop siding also	o covers exterior	wall below flo	or line covering	oossible con	crete foundation.	
Describe any deficie	encies:	Existing Condit	ion: 🗌 Excellent	Good	🗌 Fair 🗌 Poo	
The exterior wal	South (Left) Facade The exterior walls are wood framed and clad in non-beveled (drop-novelty) wood siding					
and corner boards. Window and door trim is wood without ornamentation. Drop siding also covers exterior wall below floor line covering possible concrete foundation. Walls at dining addition are stone and mortar below with drop siding installed at slope of roof above						
Photo Numbers: 9	-11,13, 15	Illu	stration Numbers:	5-6		

Element/Feature:	Exterior V	Valls					
This involves:	An original partA later addition	of the building	Estimated date of	of construction:	Varies	5	
Describe existing fea	ture:						
West (Rear) Fac	ade						
	Exterior wall at rear facing gable form is wood framed and clad in non-beveled (drop-novelty) wood siding and corner boards. Window and door trim is wood without ornamentation.						
Wall at dining ad	dition are stone	and mortar be	low with drop	siding above	Э.		
Wall at kitchen and bath addition is CMU							
Describe any deficie	ncies:	Existing Condition	on: 🗌 Exceller	t 🔳 Good	🗌 Fair	Poor	
North (Right) Fac	cade						

Exterior walls are wood framed and clad in non-beveled (drop-novelty) wood siding and corner boards. Window and door trim is wood without ornamentation.

Drop siding also covers exterior wall below floor line covering possible concrete foundation.

Photo Numbers: 13-14,17

Illustration Numbers: **7,8**

6. Foundation

Use this section to describe the foundation including its system, materials, perimeter foundation drainage, and other foundation-related features. Supplemental pages should be used to describe additional elements and features.

Element/Feature:	Found	dation					
This involves:	An origiA later a	nal part of the build addition	0	ed date of c	onstruction: _	Varies	\$
Describe existing fea	ature:						
The foundation	is obscure	d by wood siding	g and there	fore, unab	le to be ve	rified.	
A visible CMU fo	oundation	wall is located a	t the rear of	f bathroom	n and kitche	en additior	า.
	The walls of the dining room area are stone and morter construction which extends below grade at the exterior.						
Describe any deficie	encies:	Existing C	ondition:	Excellent	□ Good	🗌 Fair	Poor
Photo Numbers: 1	2, 14-	15,18	_ Illustration I	Numbers:	5-8		

7. Porches

Use this section to describe the porches Address decorative features including porch posts, brackets, railing, and floor and ceiling materials. Supplemental pages should be used to describe additional elements and features.

Element/Feature	Entry Porch					
This involves:	An original part of the buildiA later addition	ng Estimated date of co	onstruction: Pre 1	1983		
Describe existing fe	eature:					
A wrap around porch located at the northeast corner of home was added sometime before 1983						
The porch and roof are supported by square posts and the balustrade includes narrow turned balusters.						
Describe any defici	iencies: Existing Co	ndition: Excellent	🔳 Good 🛛 🗌 Fair	Poor		
Photo Numbers:	0-11, 21, 23-25	Illustration Numbers:	1, 2, 4, 5-8			

8. Mechanical System, Utility Systems, Service Equipment & Electrical

Use this section to describe items such as the existing HVAC system, ventilation, plumbing, electrical, and fire suppression systems. Supplemental pages should be used to describe additional elements and features.

00.pp: 0001011 0j 01011		-				100.	
Element/Feature	"MEP Sys	tems					
This involves:	An original partA later addition	t of the building	Estimated date of	construction:	Varies	; 	
Describe existing fe	eature:						
Mechanical app	pliances are locat	ed in closet to	o north of upper l	evel bedroo	m at west		
All MEP installa	All MEP installations are to be removed and replaced with code compliant systems.						
Describe any defici	iencies:	Existing Condi	tion: 🗌 Excellent	□ Good	Fair	Poor	
Photo Numbers: 2	26	1	ustration Numbers:	4-5,7-8	}		

If you have questions regarding the requirements on this application or process please contact a member of the Park City Planning Staff at (435) 615-5060 or visit us online at www.parkcity.org. Updated 10/2014.

Door Survey Fo	rm
Total number of door openings on the exterior of the structure	: 4
Number of historic doors on the structure	: 4
Number of existing replacement/non-historic doors	. 0
Number of doors completely missing	. 0

Please reference assigned door numbers based on the Physical Conditions Report.

Number of doors to be replaced: 4

Door #:	Existing Condition (Excellent, Good, Fair, Poor):	Describe any deficiencies:	Photo #:	Historic (50 years or older):
101	Good		24	yes
102	Good		24	yes
103	Good		23	yes
201	Good		13	yes
	Fair			

Window Survey F	orm
Total number of window openings on the exterior of the structure:	10
Number of historic windows on the structure:	10
Number of existing replacement/non-historic windows	0
Number of windows completely missing:	0

Please reference assigned window numbers based on the Physical Conditions Report.

Number of windows to be replaced: 10

Window #:	Existing Condition (Excellent, Good, Fair, Poor):	Describe any deficiencies:	Photo #:	Historic (50 years or older):
A	Good		2,11,30	
В	Good		2,15	
В	Good			
С	Good		2,14	
D	Good		2,14	
E	Good		2,19	
F	Good		2,19	
G	Good		2,25	
Н	Good		2,25	
J	Good		3,11	
	Fair			
	Fair			
	Fair			

11. Interior Photographs

Use this section to describe interior conditions. Provide photographs of the interior elevations of each room. (This can be done by standing in opposite corners of a square room and capturing two walls in each photo.)

(This can be done by standing in opposite corners of a square room and capturing two wails in each photo.)							
Element/Feature:	Interior Ph	notos					
This involves:	An original partA later addition	of the building	Estima	ated date of c	onstruction:	Varies	6
Describe existing fea	ature:						
All existing interi Photo descriptio	-		1.				
Describe any deficie	ncies:	Existing Condit	ion:	Excellent	□ Good	Fair	Poor

Photo Numbers: 27-36

Illustration Numbers:

PARK CITY MUNICIPAL CORPORATION PLANNING DEPARTMENT 445 MARSAC AVE - PO BOX 1480 PARK CITY, UT 84060 (435) 615-5060



	HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLAN For Use with the Historic District/Site Design Review Application	
PLANNING DIR		_
PROJECT INFO LANDMA NAME: ADDRESS:	RMATION	_
TAX ID: SUBDIVISION: SURVEY:	SA-312 C Snyder's Addition LOT #: 5 & South 1/2 of 6 BLOCK #: 30	
APPLICANT INF NAME: PHONE #: EMAIL:	FORMATION Dr. Regis McHugh () - FAX #: () - regiswmchugh@gmail.com	

Site Design

Use this section should describe the scope of work and preservation treatment for landscape features such as stone retaining walls, hillside steps, and fencing. Existing landscaping and site grading as well as parking should also be documented. Use supplemental pages if necessary.

Element/Feat	ure: Site Work	
This involves:	Preservation	Restoration
	Reconstruction	Rehabilitation
Based on the condition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail the proposed work:		
Excavation to be done on site for added lower level living space and garage, concrete		

Concrete flat work to be installed at driveway, and patio areas at north side yard, and backyard

Concrete retaining walls are to be installed at north and south of driveway, and at west end of north facade.

Stacked stone retaining walls are to be installed around perimeter of concrete patios as required

Structure

driveway, and backyard patio.

Use this section to describe scope of work and preservation treatment for the general structural system of the building including floor and ceiling systems as well as the roof structure. Supplemental pages should be used to describe additional elements and features.

Element/Feature: Structural Upgrades and Additons		
This involves:	Preservation	Restoration
	Reconstruction	Rehabilitation

Based on the condition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail the proposed work:

Existing home is to be stabilized, lifted, and temporarily placed on wood cribbing.

A new basement depth concrete foundation to be installed at perimeter of existing structure to remain, added garage, and addition to west. Existing structure is to be set in place and secured on new foundation

Existing upper level floor framing is to be removed and new floor is to be framed at lowered elevation. Existing main level floor framing is to be inspected then repaired and replaced as needed. Existing roof framing is to be inspected then repaired and replaced as needed.

Wood framed addition is to be built west of historic structure.

If you have questions regarding the requirements on this application or process please contact a member of the Park City Planning Staff at (435) 615-5060 or visit us online at www.parkcity.org. Updated 10/2014.

Roof

Use this section to describe the proposed scope of work and preservation treatment for the roofing system, flashing, drainage such as downspouts and gutters, skylights, chimneys, and other rooftop features. Use supplemental pages if necessary.

Element/Featu	_{ire:} Roof	
This involves:	Preservation	Restoration
	Reconstruction	Rehabilitation
Based on the cou the proposed wo		utlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail
All existing roof framing is to be inspected then repaired and replaced as needed.		
New roof areas are to be constructed per structural drawings.		

All existing asphalt shingle and rolled roofing is to be removed and new 50 year architectural asphalt shingles are to be installed at all roof areas (existing and new) over new underlayment.

Chimney

Use this section to describe the proposed scope of work and preservation treatment for any existing chimneys. One box should be devoted to each existing chimney. Supplemental pages should be used to describe additional elements and features.

Element/Feature:	Mechanical F	lues
This involves:		RestorationRehabilitation

Based on the condition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail the proposed work:

Existing mechanical flues are to be removed.

New mechanical flues are to be installed as required.

Exterior Walls

Use this section to describe the proposed scope of work and preservation treatment for the exterior wall construction, finishes, and masonry. Please describe the scope of work for each individual exterior wall, use supplemental pages if necessary.

Element/Feature: East (Front) Facade		
This involves:	Preservation	Restoration
	Reconstruction	Rehabilitation
Deced on the condit	tion and deficiencies out	lined in the Dhysical Conditions Depart places describe in detail

Based on the condition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail the proposed work:

Existing wood framing and siding are to remain. Repair and replace as needed.		

Element/Feature: South (Left) Facade

This involves:

Preservation

Restoration

Reconstruction Rehabilitation

Based on the condition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail the proposed work:

Existing wood framing and siding are to remain. Repair and replace as needed.

Existing Dining and Kitchen areas are to be removed.

A new wood framed 2 story addition is to be built behind remainder of existing structure. Exterior walls are to be clad with 6" vertical tongue and groove siding.

Element/Feature: West (Rear) Facade		
This involves:	 Preservation Reconstruction Rehabilitation 	
Based on the cont the proposed work	dition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail k:	
Existing wood framing and siding are to remain. Repair and replace as needed.		
Existing Dining, Kitchen, and west portion of Bath area are to be removed.		
A new wood framed 2 story addition is to be built behind remainder of existing structure. Exterior walls are to be clad with 6" vertical tongue and groove siding.		

Element/Feature: North (Right) Facade

This involves:

PreservationReconstruction

RestorationRehabilitation

Based on the condition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail the proposed work:

Existing wood framing and siding are to remain. Repair and replace as needed.

West portion of existing Bath area is to be removed.

A new wood framed 2 story addition is to be built behind remainder of existing structure. Exterior walls are to be clad with 6" vertical tongue and groove siding.

Foundation

Use this section to describe the proposed scope of work and preservation treatment for the foundation including its system, materials, perimeter foundation drainage, and other foundation-related features. Use supplemental pages if necessary.

Element/Feature: Concrete Foundation

This involves:

Preservation
 Reconstruction

RestorationRehabilitation

Based on the condition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail the proposed work:

A new basement depth concrete foundation to be installed at perimeter of existing structure to remain, added garage, and addition to west. Existing structure is to be set in place and secured on new foundation.

Concrete light wells at lower level windows are to be poured as part of foundation.

Concrete retaining walls are to be dowelled into new concrete foundation.

Porches

Use this section to describe the proposed scope of work and preservation treatment for all porches Address decorative features including porch posts, brackets, railing, and floor and ceiling materials.

Element/Feature: Concrete entry porch		
This involves:	Preservation	Restoration
	Reconstruction	Rehabilitation

Based on the condition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail the proposed work:

The existing wood entry porch is to be removed and replaced with a new concrete entry porch matching the existing dimensions.

Doors

Use this section to describe the proposed scope of work and preservation treatment for all exterior doors, door openings, and door parts referenced in the Door Survey of the Physical Conditions Report. Please describe the scope of work for each individual exterior door, use supplemental pages if necessary.

Element/Featu	Ire: Exterior Doors
Based on the condition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail the proposed work: Historic doors are listed as shown on as built floor plans and in Physical Conditions Report 101 - To be removed and replaced with faux door and transom with historic character 102 - To be removed and replaced with new wood door and transom with historic character 103 - To be removed and replaced with faux door with historic character 201 - To be removed and replaced with faux door with historic character All new doors are to be aluminum clad wood.	

Element/Feature:

This involves:

- PreservationReconstruction
- RestorationRehabilitation

Based on the condition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail the proposed work:

Windows

Use this section to describe the proposed scope of work and preservation treatment for all exterior windows, window openings, and windows parts referenced in the Door Survey of the Physical Conditions Report. Please describe the scope of work for each individual exterior window, use supplemental pages if necessary.

Element/Feature	Windows	
This involves:	 Preservation Restoration Rehabilitation 	
Based on the cond the proposed work:	ition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail	
All existing historic windows are to be removed and replaced with new wood windows matching the type, dimensions and historic character of existing. New windows are to be aluminum clad wood.		
Element/Feature	:	

This involves:

- PreservationReconstruction
- RestorationRehabilitation

Based on the condition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail the proposed work:

Mechanical System, Utility Systems, Service Equipment & Electrical

Use this section to describe proposed scope of work and preservation treatment for items such as the existing HVAC system, ventilation, plumbing, electrical, and fire suppression systems. Supplemental pages should be used to describe additional elements and features. Use supplemental pages if necessary.

Element/Featur	e: MEP Systems
This involves:	 Preservation Restoration Reconstruction Rehabilitation
Based on the cond the proposed work	dition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail k:
-	chanical, electrical, and plumbing systems are to be removed and replaced compliant systems.

Additions

Use this section to describe the proposed scope of work for any additions. Describe the impact and the preservation treatment for any historic materials. Supplemental pages should be used to describe additional elements and features. Use supplemental pages if necessary.

Element/Featu	are: Addition	
This involves:	Preservation	Restoration
	Reconstruction	Rehabilitation

Based on the condition and deficiencies outlined in the Physical Conditions Report, please describe in detail the proposed work:

A new basement depth concrete foundation is to be installed at perimeter of existing structure to remain, added garage, and addition to west. Living space and garage added at lower level.

Existing dining, kitchen, and west portion of main level bath area are to be removed and a new wood framed 2 story addition is to be built behind remainder of existing structure.

Exterior walls of all wood framed addition areas are to be clad with 6" vertical tongue and groove siding.

4. PROJECT TEAM

List the individuals and firms involved in designing and executing the proposed work. Include the names and contact information for the architect, designer, preservation professional, contractor, subcontractors, specialized craftspeople, specialty fabricators, etc...

Provide a statement of competency for each individual and/or firm listed above. Include a list or description of relevant experience and/or specialized training or skills.

Will a licensed architect or qualified preservation professional be involved in the analysis and design alternatives chosen for the project? Yes or No. If yes, provide his/her name.

Will a licensed architect or other qualified professional be available during construction to ensure the project is executed according to the approved plans? Yes or No. If yes, provide his/her name.

5. SITE HISTORY

Provide a brief history of the site to augment information from the Historic Site Form. Include information about uses, owners, and dates of changes made (if known) to the site and/or buildings. Please list all sources such as permit records, current/past owner interviews, newspapers, etc. used in compiling the information.

6. FINANCIAL GUARANTEE

The Planning Department is authorized to require that the Applicant provide the City with a financial Guarantee to ensure compliance with the conditions and terms of the Historic Preservation Plan. (See Title 15, LMC Chapter 11-9) Describe how you will satisfy the financial guarantee requirements.

7. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RESPONSIBILITY

I have read and understand the instructions supplied by Park City for processing this form as part of the Historic District/Site Design Review application. The information I have provided is true and correct to the best of my knowledge.

Signature of Applicant:		Date:	
Name of Applicant:	Regis McHugh		



Historic Preservation Board Staff Report

Planning Department

Author:	Anya Grahn, Historic Preservation Planner
Subject:	Historic Sites Inventory
Address:	1503 Park Avenue/1501 Silver King Drive
Project Number:	PL-18-03830
Date:	May 16, 2018
Type of Item:	Administrative – Determination of Significance for Garage

Summary Recommendation:

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board review the application, conduct a public hearing, and forward a recommendation to City Council to remove the designation of the garage at 1503 Park Avenue as a Landmark structure on the Park City Historic Sites Inventory (HSI) in accordance with the attached findings of fact and conclusions of law.

Topic:

Project Name:	1503 Park Avenue/1501 Silver King Drive
Applicant:	Dennis Hulbert (Architect Craig Elliot)
Owners:	Dennis Hulbert
Proposal:	Determination of Significance for the Garage

Background:

The Park City Historic Sites Inventory (HSI), adopted February 4, 2009, currently includes 406 sites of which 186 sites meet the criteria for designation as Landmark Sites and 222 sites meet the criteria for designation as Significant Sites. Since 2009, according to LMC 15-11-10(B), staff has reviewed Determination of Significance (DOS) applications with the HPB on a case-by-case basis in order to keep the Historic Sites Inventory (HSI) current.

On March 28, 2018, the owner, Dennis Hulbert, submitted an application for a Determination of Significance for this site; the application was deemed complete on April 5, 2018. Per LMC 15-11-10(B), any Owner of a Building (main, attached, detached or public), Accessory Building, and/or Structure, may nominate it for listing in the Park City Historic Sites Inventory. The Planning Department may nominate a Building (main, attached, detached or public), Accessory Building, Accessory Building, and/or Structure for listing in the Park City Historic Sites Inventory. The Planning Department may nominate a Building (main, attached, detached or public), Accessory Building, and/or Structure for listing in the Park City Historic Sites Inventory. The City Council shall make the final determination on all Determination of Significance applications considering the criteria outlined in LMC 15-11-10(A).

On April 11, 2018, staff, Anne Oliver of SWCA Environmental Consultants, Architect Craig Elliot and owner Dennis Hulbert met on site to inspect the garage. The findings of this site visit have been included in the consultant's analysis of historical significance (Exhibit B).

History of the Structure and Site:

It is difficult to trace the history and ownership of this property. Until 1935, the site was owned by the Ontario Mining Company. The site's location was outside of the original Park City Survey and was not included as part of the historic Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps. No historic photographs or tax assessments are available for this site. Staff has verified that the house was built prior to the 1930 Federal Census, as this census shows that Victor and Jennie Peterson lived at this address. In 1935, the Petersons purchased this site per title research. Vic Peterson was a University of Utah graduate and a teacher in the Park City School District for over 40 years. The Petersons sold the property and moved to Salt Lake City in 1973.

Based on the style and construction materials of the house, it is likely the house was built between 1920 and 1930.

The two-car garage to the west of the historic house was built in its present location by 1952, based on analysis of historic aerial photographs of the area. The garage is a simple gable-front building with two wood paneled garage doors. It measures approximately 22 feet 3 inches deep by 20 feet wide. As indicated in the applicant's analysis (Exhibit A), the garage has a framed structure consisting of dimensional lumber, consistent with the grade standards available after 1949. It was built on a concrete slab foundation. It has framed walls clad in contemporary drop siding that differs from the siding seen on the historic house. The roof structure has exposed 2x4 rafter tails beneath the eaves. The original roof decking was later covered with plywood and asphalt shingle siding.

In 1979, current owner Dennis Hulbert became part owner of the property, and he gained full ownership in 1991. In 1994, the applicant requested a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition (CAD) for the historic houses at 1503 Park Avenue and 1503-1/2 Park Avenue, as well as the garage at 1503 Park Avenue. In May 1995, the Historic District Commission (HDC) approved the demolition of the historic house at 1503-1/2 Park Avenue, but denied the demolition of the house at 1503 Park Avenue; it is not clear how the HDC ruled on the garage as it is not discussed in the minutes or staff report. Per the May 15, 1994, HDC minutes, the commission discussed accessory buildings and found, "Because of their condition and their location outside the Historic District, they have little historical significance." On January 14, 1999, the Park City Council approved the two-lot Hulbert-Holler Subdivision; however, the plat was never recorded with the Summit County Recorder's Office.

On March 28, 2018, the owner submitted a Determination of Significance application to remove the historic designation from the garage. The application was deemed complete on April 5, 2018.

History of Surveys:

Allen Roberts completed the first National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) reconnaissance level survey (RLS) in September 1995. In his analysis, he finds that the house was built c.1920, and he does not discuss the garage. He classifies the site as

"A/B", A meaning that the site is "potentially eligible/architecturally significant and intact" or B "potentially eligible/slightly less significant and/or intact."

In the early 2000s, Park City Municipal Corporation contracted Preservation Solutions, led by consultant Dina Williams-Blaes, to refine and redefine Park City's preservation policy. In 2007, she completed a reconnaissance level survey. This survey differed from previous surveys of the Historic District in that its sole focus was not on identifying structures that were eligible for the NRHP; rather, it identified buildings that met *the City's* criteria for designation as "historic" as was outlined by the Land Management Code (LMC) at that time.

In this 2007 survey, Preservation Solutions found that the buildings at 1503 Park Avenue met the criteria for listing on the City's Historic Site Inventory as "Landmark" and eligible for the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) (Exhibit C). Williams-Blaes found that the building was constructed c. 1920 and contributes to the "Mature Mining Era". Her narrative in the Historic Sites Form only describes the house, and does not analyze the garage though she notes an "accessory building."

On February 4, 2009, the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) approved a resolution adopting the Historic Sites Inventory [<u>Staff Report</u> (starting page 21) and <u>Minutes</u> (starting page 3)]. The house and garage at 1503 Park Avenue were two of over 400 buildings nominated to the HSI that day. They were designated as "Landmark" and found to contribute to the Mature Mining Era (1894 to 1930).

By 2009, the <u>Historic Site Form</u> had maintained that the house was constructed in 1900, which is consistent with the Summit County Recorder's Office.

In 2015, CRSA completed an Intensive Level Survey (ILS) (Exhibit C). In CRSA's analysis, the surveyors find yet again that the site is "eligible/contributing" to the NRHP. In it, they describe:

"1503 Park is a bungalow cottage type house that has not had many modifications made to it. While the bungalow cottage is not one of the main three house types built during the historic Park City mining era, it was still common during that time period. Not much is known about the early years of the house, as it is just outside of the boundaries for the Sanborn maps, and there is no historic tax photo to reference. Though the conclusions about the form are difficult to reach, the materials are telling, and do not appear to have been majorly altered. The side gable roof is sheathed with composition shingles, and the roof of the garage on the lot is sheathed with tar paper. The walls are clad with drop novelty wood siding, as are the walls of the garage. The windows are wooden single hung type windows, and there is a pair on either side of the centered door. The door appears to be a wood frame and panel door with three narrow upper lights, and has a wood screen door in front of it. A small gable protrudes from the roof to cover the porch area, and is supported by square wood piers that taper slightly towards the top. The house is raised up on a concrete foundation. The garage is to the rear of the house, and has space for two cars. The overall form and materiality of the building remains intact and the building retains its historic value."

Once again, the garage was not individually reviewed and analyzed for its historic integrity and significance.

The historic designation of the historic house at 1503 Park Avenue is not proposed to be changed; however, further research has shown several inaccuracies related to the date of construction. Staff has proposed to update these as part of a new Historic Sites Form that eliminates the garage from the designation of the site (Exhibit D).

Analysis and Discussion:

Analysis of Structure and Historic Significance:

The applicant has submitted their analysis of the garage's historical significance; this is included as Exhibit A. In addition to staff's analysis, staff has also requested Preservation Consultant Anne Oliver of SWCA Environmental Consultants to help analyze the historical significance of the garage at 1503 Park Avenue; Ms. Oliver's analysis has been included as Exhibit B.

Staff finds that the garage structure would not meet the criteria for Landmark designation, based on the following:

LANDMARK SITE. Any Buildings (main, attached, detached, or public), Accessory Buildings, and/or Structures may be designated to the Historic Sites Inventory as a Landmark Site if the Planning Department finds it meets all the criteria listed below:

(a) It is at least fifty (50) years old or has achieved Significance or if the Site is of exceptional importance to the community; and

Complies. Based on aerial photograph analysis, the garage was constructed by 1952. It is about 66 years old. While the site is significant to the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930) because of the c.1930 historic house, the garage individually is not of exceptional importance to the community and was built after the site's era of significance.

(b) It retains its Historic Integrity in terms of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association as defined by the National Park Service for the National Register of Historic Places; and

Does not comply. This LMC criterion outlines the <u>Seven Aspects of Integrity</u>, as defined by the National Park Service (NPS), and staff has analyzed this building for compliance with these aspects. While the garage retains its integrity in terms of its location, design, setting, materials, and workmanship, it does not have sufficient integrity to be individually listed on the NRHP or the Park City HSI.

The c.1952 garage structure does not evoke the aesthetic or historic sense of the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930). The c.1930 historic house was constructed during this era and reflects architectural styles and detailing that contribute to the look and feel typical of buildings constructed during this era. In the 1950s and 1960s, it was more common for women to have driver's licenses and families could afford two vehicles. This garage responds to the affordability of automobiles and the mobility of families in the postwar era.

(c) It is significant in local, regional or national history, architecture, engineering or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following:

(i) <u>An era that has made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our</u> <u>history;</u>

Does not Comply. Staff finds that this garage does not contribute to the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930), nor does it individually contribute to our understanding of the Mining Decline and Emergence of Recreation Industry Era (1931-1962).

Original and historic accessory structures can contribute to the historical significance of a site and its surroundings when they have achieved historical significance in their own right. Sometimes these buildings reflect their intended use, such as the industrial garages and sheds located along Daly Avenue. Other times, historic garages contribute to our understanding of the emergence and impacts of the automobile on the neighborhood's urban fabric as is the case with the garage at <u>1057 Woodside</u>. By the 1950s, garages were common and the garage at this site does not contribute to the historical significance of its c.1930 house.

(ii) <u>The lives of Persons significant in the history of the community, state, region, or</u> <u>nation;</u>

Does not Comply. While the garage was likely constructed by Victor Peterson, University of Utah alumnus and Park City school teacher, the historic house is a better reflection of his importance in the community. Primary structures dictate the principal use of the property.

(iii) <u>The distinctive characteristics of type, period, or method of construction or the</u> work of a notable architect or master craftsman

Does not Comply. This garage was constructed of readily available construction materials. The garage consists of a concrete slab foundation with a low stem wall. The framed structure constructed of dimensional lumber sits atop this stem wall. The exterior walls are clad in drop siding, finished with corner boards. As explained in the consultant's report, "Exposed rafter tails are visible under the open eaves and the moderately

pitched roof is covered with asphalt roll roofing laid over an upper layer of randomly sized pieces of plywood and a lower layer of original board sheathing."

As previously discussed, the garage does not contribute to the significance of the historic house, constructed in c.1930 and historically significant to the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930).

Analyzing the garage separate from the historic house, there is nothing distinctive about its character in terms of the building's type, form, or method of construction that contributes to the Mining Decline and Emergence of Recreation Industry Era (1931-1962). The design is consistent with garage styles that emerged during the postwar period and have continued to be utilized today.

The original builder was not a notable architect or master craftsman.

In order to maintain its designation as "Significant" on the HSI, the Historic Preservation Board will need to determine that the building meets the criteria for Significant, as outlined below:

SIGNIFICANT SITE. Any Buildings (main, attached, detached or public), Accessory Buildings and/or Structures may be designated to the Historic Sites Inventory as a Significant Site if the Planning Department finds it meets all the criteria listed below:

(a) It is at least fifty (50) years old or the Site is of exceptional importance to the community; and

Complies. Based on its form as a two-car garage, materials used in its construction, and its framed wall construction, staff finds that the garage was likely constructed c.1952. It is about 66 years old. While the site is significant to the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930) because of the c.1930 historic house, the garage individually is not of exceptional importance to the community.

(b) It retains its Essential Historical Form as may be demonstrated but not limited by any of the following:

(i) It previously received a historic grant from the City; or (ii) It was previously listed on the Historic Sites Inventory; or (iii) It was listed as Significant or on any reconnaissance or intensive level survey of historic resources; or

Complies. The overall design of the garage has not changed since its construction in c.1952. It is a rectangular building with shallow-pitched front-gable roof. There are two individual wood paneled garage doors on the façade, facing 15th Street. The roof has been repaired with new plywood sheathing and rolled asphalt roofing.

On the interior, the owner has made an effort to stabilize the structure by adding new posts and beams as necessary.

The garage has never received a historic district grant from the City. During the CAD review for this site in 1994, the HDC found, "Because of their [accessory buildings] condition and their location outside the Historic District, they have little historical significance."

The site was designated as "Landmark" when the HSI was adopted in 2009; however, staff finds that the historical significance of the site is due to the c.1930 house. The historical significance is not derived from the c.1952 two-car garage. Echoing the 2009 reconnaissance level survey, CRSA's 2015 ILS found that the site was eligible for the NRHP. While the garage building does not contribute to the historical significance of the site, it also does not detract from it because of its neutral and simple design.

(c) It has one (1) or more of the following:

(i) It retains its historic scale, context, materials in a manner and degree which can be restored to Historical Form even if it has non-historic additions; and (ii) It reflects the Historical or Architectural character of the site or district through design characteristics such as mass, scale, composition, materials, treatment, cornice, and/or other architectural features as are Visually Compatible to the Mining Era Residences National Register District even if it has non-historic additions; or

Complies. The garage retains its historic scale, context, and materials. Since its construction in c.1952, minimal changes have occurred to garage apart from maintenance and the construction of a plywood addition on the rear (north) elevation. It is small in scale and mass; it was designed and built to be subordinate to the c.1930 historic house and it has remained so. It is an ordinary detached two-car garage building that neither contributes nor detracts from the architecture of the bungalow-inspired cottage-style house. It does not contribute to the historical significance of the house, which has been determined by the c.1930 house to be the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930).

(d) It is important in local or regional history architecture, engineering, or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following:

(i) An era of Historic Importance to the community, or (ii) Lives of Persons who were of Historic importance to the community, or (iii) Noteworthy methods of construction, materials, or craftsmanship used during the Historic period.

Does not comply. In order for the garage to contribute to local or regional history, architecture, engineering, or cultural associations, it needs to reflect the period in which it gained this significance. Staff finds that the garage does not reflect the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930) as accessory buildings of this era were typically barns, chicken coops, sheds used for industrial and storage purposes, and even

single-car garages that emerged after 1900 when automobiles became more prevalent. Constructed in 1950, the garage also does not individually contribute to our understanding of the Mining Decline and Emergence of Recreation Industry Era (1931-1962).

While the site was owned by Victor Peterson, long-time Park City educator and resident, the historic house is a better reflection of his importance in the community. Primary structures dictate the principal use and historical significance of the property.

Finally, this is an ordinary garage. While it does not detract from the architectural and historical significance of the c.1930 historic house, it does not contribute to the historical significance of the site. It is the house that contributes to the historical significance of the district. The garage does not have enough significance in its own right to be listed on the NRHP or the Park City Historic Sites Inventory independently of the house.

Process:

The HPB shall hold a public hearing and may hear testimony from the applicant and the public and will review the Application for compliance with the "Criteria for Designating Historic Sites to the Park City Historic Sites Inventory." The HPB shall forward a copy of its written findings to City Council for Final Action.

Since 15-11-10 of the Land Management Code codifies the Historic Sites Inventory, State Code requires the Planning Commission to make a recommendation to City Council regarding amending the Land Management Code. This code amendment is scheduled for June 13, 2018, and shall forward a recommendation to City Council. City Council shall hear testimony from the applicant and the public and will review the Application for compliance with the "Criteria for Designating Historic Sites to the Park City Historic Sites Inventory" as well as amendments to Land Management Code (LMC) 15-11-10 Park City Historic Sites Inventory on June 21, 2018. City Council shall take Final Action on this item.

The Applicant or any party with standing may appeal City Council's determination to Third District Court.

Notice:

On May 5, 2018, Legal Notice of this public hearing was published in the Park Record, according to the requirements of the Land Management Code. Staff also posted a public notice on the property and sent a mailing notice to the property owner and property owners May 2, 2018.

Public Input:

A public hearing, conducted by the Historic Preservation Board and City Council, is required prior to adding sites to or removing sites from the Historic Sites Inventory. The public hearing for the recommended action was properly and legally noticed as required

by the Land Management Code. No public input was received at the time of writing this report.

Alternatives:

- Conduct a public hearing on the Site described herein and forward a positive recommendation to City Council to remove the designation of the Site as historic on the Historic Sites Inventory based on the findings of fact and conclusions of law set forth in the staff report.
- Conduct a public hearing and reject staff's recommendation to delist the site from the Historic Sites Inventory, providing specific findings of fact and conclusions of law for the action.
- Continue the action to a date certain.

Significant Impacts:

The garage is currently designated as "Landmark" on the City's Historic Sites Inventory (HSI). The site will remain designated as "Landmark"; however, the historic designation will not extend the garage. It may be demolished in the future.

Staff believes that one of the purposes of the HPB is to preserve the City's unique Historic character and maintain an accurate list of historically designated structures on the HSI. The HSI is weakened by maintaining buildings that no longer meet the criteria for historic designation, specifically "Landmark" as outlined in LMC 15-11-10(A)(1). It is in the City's best interest to maintain an accurate and current list.

Recommendation:

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board review the application, conduct a public hearing, and forward a recommendation to City Council to remove the designation of the garage at 1503 Park Avenue as a Landmark structure on the Park City Historic Sites Inventory (HSI) in accordance with the attached findings of fact and conclusions of law.

Finding of Fact:

- 1. The property is located at 1503 Park Avenue, in the Recreation Commercial (RC) zoning district.
- There is little evidence to trace the history and ownership of this property. Until 1935, the site was owned by the Ontario Mining Company and the location of the site was outside of the original Park City Survey. It was not documented by Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps. No historic photographs or tax assessments are available for this site.
- 3. The 1930 Federal Census shows that Victor and Jennie Peterson lived at this address and title research shows they purchased the site in 1935. Victor Peterson was a University of Utah graduate and teacher in the Park City School District for over 40 years. The Petersons sold the property and moved to Salt Lake City in 1973.
- 4. Based on the style and construction materials of the house, it is likely the house was built between 1920 and 1930. It is evident that the house was in existence

by 1930 as the Federal Census shows the Petersons living at this address at that time.

- 5. The two-car garage to the west of the historic house was built in its present location by c.1952, based on analysis of historic aerial photogaphs, the building form and style, and construction materials.
- 6. The garage is a framed structure consisting of dimensional lumber, consistent with grade standards available after 1949. It was built on a concrete slab foundation. It has framed walls clad in contemporary drop siding that differs from the siding on the historic house. The roof has exposed 2x4 rafter tails beneath the eaves. The original roof decking has been covered with plywood and rolled asphalt siding.
- 7. In 1979, current owner Dennis Hulbert became part owner of the property, and he gained full ownership in 1991.
- In 1994, the owner requested a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition (CAD) for the historic houses at 1503 Park Avenue and 1503-1/2 Park Avenue, as well as the garage at 1503 Park Avenue. In May 1995, the Historic District Commission (HDC) approved the demolition of the house at 1503-1/2 Park Avenue, but denied the demolition of the house at 1503 Park Avenue.
- 9. Per the May 15, 1994, HDC minutes, the commission discussed accessory buildings and found, "Because of their condition and their location outside the Historic District, they have little historical significance."
- 10. On January 14, 1999, the Park City Council approved the two-lot Hulbert-Holler Subdivision; however, the plat was never recorded.
- 11. In the early 2000s, Park City Municipal Corporation contracted Preservation Solutions, led by Dina Williams-Blaes, to refine and redefine Park City's preservation policy. She completed a reconnaissance level survey in 2007. Her Site Form for 1503 Park Avenue only analyzes the historical significance of the house, not the garage, and found that it contributed to the "Mature Mining Era."
- 12. On February 4, 2009, the Historic Preservation Board approved a resolution adopting the Historic Sites Inventory. The garage and house at 1503 Park Avenue were designated as "Landmark" and found to be eligible for the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP). She found that the house was constructed c. 1900 and contributed to the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930).
- 13. In 2015, CRSA completed an intensive level survey and found that the site was "eligible/contributing" to the NRHP. Once again the garage was not individually reviewed and analyzed for its historic integrity and significance.
- 14. Based on aerial photograph analysis, the garage was built by 1952 making it at least 66 years old. While the site is significant to the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930) because of the c.1930 historic house, the garage individually is not of exceptional importance to the community and was built after the site's era of significance.
- 15. The garage does not meet the criteria to be designated as Landmark and as outlined by Land Management Code (LMC) 15-11-10(A)(1).
- 16. While the garage retains its integrity in terms of its location, design, setting, materials, and workmanship, it does not have sufficient integrity to be individually listed on the NRHP or the Park City HSI. The c.1952 garage structure does not

evoke the aesthetic or historic sense of the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930). The c.1930 historic house was constructed during this era and reflects architectural styles and detailing that contribute to the look and feel typical of buildings constructed during this era. In the 1950s and 1960s, it was more common for women to have driver's licenses and families could afford two vehicles. This garage responds to the affordability of automobiles and the mobility of families in the postwar era.

- 17. This garage does not contribute to the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930), nor does it individually contribute to our understanding of the Mining Decline and Emergence of Recreation Industry Era (1931-1962). Original and historic accessory structures can contribute to the historical significance of a site and its surroundings when they have achieved historical significance in their own right. By the 1950s, garages were common and the garage at this site does not contribute to the historical significance of its c.1930 house.
- 18. While the garage was likely constructed by Victor Peterson, University of Utah alumnus and Park City school teacher, the historic house is a better reflection of his importance in the community. Primary structures dictate the principal use of the property.
- 19. This garage was constructed of readily available construction materials. Analyzing the garage separate from the historic house, there is nothing distinctive about its character in terms of the building's type, form, or method of construction that contributes to the Mining Decline and Emergence of Recreation Industry Era (1931-1962). The design is consistent with garage styles that emerged during the postwar period and have continued to be utilized today. The original builder was not a notable architect or master craftsman.
- 20. The garage does not meet the criteria to be designated as Significant and as outlined by LMC 15-11-10(A)(2).
- The overall design of the garage has not changed since its construction in c.1952. It is a rectangular building with shallow-pitched front-gable roof. There are two individual wood paneled garage doors on the façade, facing 15th Street.
- 22. The garage has never received a historic district grant from the City.
- 23. The site was designated as "Landmark" when the HSI was adopted in 2009; however, the historical significance of the site is due to the c.1930 house. The historical significance is not derived from the c.1952 two-car garage.
- 24. The garage retains its historic scale, context, and materials. Since its construction in c.1952, minimal changes have occurred to garage apart from maintenance and the construction of a plywood addition on the rear (north) elevation. It is small in scale and mass; it was designed and built to be subordinate to the c.1930 historic house and it has remained so. It is an ordinary detached two-car garage building that neither contributes nor detracts from the architecture of the bungalow-inspired cottage-style house. It does not contribute to the historical significance of the house, which has been determined by the c.1930 house to be the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930).

In order for the garage to contribute to local or regional history, architecture, engineering, or cultural associations, it needs to reflect the period in which it gained this significance. The garage does not reflect the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930). Constructed in 1950, the garage also does not individually contribute to our understanding of the Mining Decline and Emergence of Recreation Industry Era (1931-1962).

- 25. The garage does not have enough significance in its own right to be listed on the NRHP or the Park City Historic Sites Inventory independently of the house.
- 26. On March 28, 2018, the owner submitted a Determination of Significance application to remove the historic designation from the garage. The application was deemed complete on April 5, 2018.

Conclusions of Law:

- 1. The existing house located at 1503 Park Avenue does not meet all of the criteria for designating sites to the Park City Historic Sites Inventory as a Landmark Site including:
 - a. It is at least fifty (50) years old or has achieved Significance or if the Site is of exceptional importance to the community; and **Complies**;
 - b. It retains its Historic Integrity in terms of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association as defined by the National Park Service for the National Register of Historic Places; and **Does Not Comply.**

c. It is significant in local, regional or national history, architecture, engineering or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following:

- *i.* An era that has made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history;
- *ii.* The lives of Persons significant in the history of the community, state, region, or nation; or
- *iii.* The distinctive characteristics of type, period, or method of construction or the work of a notable architect or master craftsman. **Does not comply.**
- The existing house at 819 Park Avenue does not meet all of the criteria for a Significant Site as set forth in LMC Section 15-11-10(A)(2) which includes:
 (a) It is at least fifty (50) years old or the Site is of exceptional importance to the community; and

Complies.

(b) It retains its Historical Form as may be demonstrated but not limited by any of the following:

(i) It previously received a historic grant from the City; or

(ii) It was previously listed on the Historic Sites Inventory; or

(iii) It was listed as Significant or on any reconnaissance or intensive level survey of historic resources; and

Complies.

(c) It has one (1) or more of the following:

(i) It retains its historic scale, context, materials in a manner and degree which can be restored to Historical Form even if it has non-historic additions; or

(ii) It reflects the Historical or Architectural character of the site or district through design characteristics such as mass, scale, composition,

materials, treatment, cornice, and/or other architectural features as are Visually Compatible to the Mining Era Residences National Register District even if it has non-historic additions; and **Complies.**

(d) It is important in local or regional history architecture, engineering, or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following:

(i) An era of Historic Importance to the community, or

(ii) Lives of Persons who were of Historic importance to the community, or (iii) Noteworthy methods of construction, materials, or craftsmanship used during the Historic period. **Does not comply.**

Exhibits:

- Exhibit A Applicant's Analysis
- Exhibit B "Determination of Significance for Garage at 1503 Park Avenue" by Anne Oliver, Historic Preservation Consultant, SWCA Environmental Consultants
- Exhibit C 2007 RLS by Dina Williams-Blaes
- Exhibit D Historic Site Form, 2015, CRSA
- Exhibit E Updated Historic Site Form, 2018

March 27, 2018

1501 Silver King Drive & 1503 Park Avenue Determination of Significance - Garage Only

History of the Project

The majority of the information available for this property is focused on the primary residential structure located on the property. The information available follows:

House

The house at 1503 Park Avenue is located in the Residential Medium zone and is completely surrounded by dense condominium structures and parking lots. It is listed on the Historic Site Form - Historic Sites Inventory as being constructed c. 1900. This is incorrect, as the owner's records indicate that it was built in 1936. Thus the indication that it is of the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930) is also incorrect.

It is a simple one story central passage house (cottage) with a gable roof. And is constructed with stacked lumber as the exterior walls. This construction is different than the framed walls that are the construction type for the garage. The Historic Site Form also says that there are no additions to the house. This is also incorrect, as there is a small addition on the south side that includes an entry and stair and is of frame construction. The entry door and three windows face the street, there is a small overhang at the entry , supported by square posts.

Past owners include Victor Peterson. It is unclear if his name appears in any document related to the history of the house.

Summary of Insignificance

Garage

The garage is the only structure on the site that is being submitted for Determination of Significance.

Date of Construction

From inspection, it is apparent that the garage was built post 1949. This is determined by inspection of the dimensions of the lumber used in the construction. The dimensions align with the grade standards accepted in the "Simplified Practice Recommendation 16-53" which was accepted post 1949. In this accepted revisions, Grade standards were made more generalized. Size standards were continued as before, except that the standard dressed width of lumber was reduced from -3/8 to -1/2 inches. This means a 4-inch board was reduced from 3 - 5/8 to 3- 1/2 inches. Additionally, the siding on the house is a size consistent with an early period and the siding on the garage is of different dimension and indicative of contemporary siding



dimensions (See Photos). Based on this information, it is apparent that the garage was built at a minimum of 14 years after the construction of the house.

Condition of the Structure

The garage roof structure includes broken rafters and the remaining structure does not meet current code for roof loads. The Roof consists of 2x4 rafters at 24 inches on center and 2x4 stud walls at 24 inches on center. The glazing is broken throughout and the garage doors are failing.

This is not to say that the building has not been cared for. The current owner re-roofed the garage and repaired much of the underlying patchwork plywood sheathing and underlying board sheathing. Broken rafters have been repaired and support posts have been added in the middle of the garage to support the roof. Collar ties have been added to the roof structure to add stability. The roof is constructed with a ridge board, not a ridge beam. This construction was common, but often resulted in a sagging roof, which is why the additional structural work was added.

The building has been painted and maintained in finish along with the historic house. The garage has no water or sewer service, does not contain insulation, and is apparently built on a thick slab without foundation. Renovation of the structure would most likely require a complete demolition or deconstruction and reconstruction.

Considering that their are several errors on the Historic Site Report about the age and construction of the house, that the garage structure was built more than a decade later than the house, and the garage was built of contemporary materials differing from the house, it would seem appropriate to determine that the garage provides little value in historic character to the site. Thus, it would seem appropriate to determine that the garage meets the criteria to have the historic accessory structure removed from the History Sites Inventory.

Respectfully Submitted,



(


(





HPB Packet 5.16.18







Exterior Siding Dimension of Garage Size is Contemporary and Does Not Match House Siding N N

E

4 5 4

5

2 manual 8

0

10







(





(

C



C





Exhibit B



Salt Lake City Office 257 East 200 South, Suite 200 Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 Tel 801.322.4307 Fax 801.322.4308 www.swca.com

Memorandum

- To: Planning Department, Park City Municipal Corporation, Utah
- From: Anne Oliver, Principal Investigator, SWCA Environmental Consultants

Date: April 24, 2018

Re: Determination of Significance for Garage at 1503 Park Avenue

Introduction

The Planning Department has requested a formal determination of significance for a two-car garage immediately west of the house at 1503 Park Avenue. The property is listed on the Park City Municipal Corporation (PCMC) Historic Sites Inventory (HSI) as a Landmark Site that is, by PCMC definition, eligible for the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP).

Background Research and Site Visit

Two historic site forms have been prepared for the property and both state that the house was built in ca. 1900 (Ewanowski 2015 and Blaes 2008). The date was derived from data on file with the Summit County Assessor, which is often not reliable for properties built prior to World War II. Based on style and materials (particularly window types), it seems more likely that the house was built in the 1920s or ca. 1930. The first confirmed presence of a house on the property is when Victor and Jennie Peterson were recorded as the owners of a house that they were living in at 1503 Park Avenue in the 1930 U.S. Census (Ewanowski 2015).

The two-car garage is the only outbuilding on the property and is noted as present on the 2008 and 2015 site forms. However, neither form provides a date of construction for the garage, notes whether it contributes to the historic significance of the property, or comments on its integrity or eligibility for the NRHP.

No historic tax appraisal cards or historic photographs were found for the property. And because the property was built near the outskirts of town, it is outside the boundaries of all Sanborn Fire Insurance Company maps that might have noted its presence through the years. However, historic aerial photographs of the area were consulted and these confirm that the garage had been built on its present location by 1952 and remained there in 1962 (Figures 1 and 2).

A site visit to the property was conducted on April 11, 2018. Present were Dennis Hulbert, property owner; Craig Elliott, Elliott Workgroup; Anya Grahn, PCMC Historic Preservation Planner; and Anne Oliver, SWCA. The exterior and interior of the garage were visually inspected and photographed, with particular attention paid to 1) physical details that might confirm a date of construction and 2) the historic integrity of the garage.

Building Description

The garage at 1503 Park Avenue measures 22 feet 3 inches deep and 20 feet 0 inches wide (Figure 3). It was built on a concrete slab foundation with a low stem wall that supports wood-framed walls clad in drop siding. The walls are finished with corner boards. Exposed rafter tails are visible under the open eaves and the moderately pitched roof is covered with asphalt roll roofing that has been laid over an upper layer of randomly sized pieces of plywood and a lower layer of original board sheathing (Figures 4-7).

Two overhead garage doors are on the south side of the building; these are wood-framed and fitted with plywood panels, two above and two below a central band. Within this band, each garage door has two four-pane, fixed windows flanked by smaller plywood panels. A three-panel, single-light wood person door opens on the south end of the east wall. On the east and west sides, toward the rear (north) end of the building, are a pair of one-by-one, fixed, single-pane windows. A porcelain knob remaining from early electrical service is visible under the eave on the east wall (Figure 8).

On the interior, the walls and ceiling are unfinished and the original framing is visible, including the board sheathing over the rafters (Figures 9 and 10). The framing lumber and sheathing is somewhat randomly sized, indicating that the garage may have been built, at least in part, from salvaged materials. The trusses originally spanned the width of the garage but these have been reinforced with wood support posts by the present owner. A few cracked rafters have also been supplemented with sistered lengths of lumber and diagonal bracing. The original steel door-opening hardware, including corner reinforcing and springs, remains on both garage doors (Figure 11).

Most elements of the building exterior appear largely unchanged since the time of construction. The few alterations are limited to repainting, the application of plywood sheathing over the original board sheathing on the roof, and the replacement of the original roof covering (of unknown material) with asphalt roofing. As well, a small, hip-roofed addition was built on the north end of the garage in ca. 1995 by the present owner. It is wood-framed and clad in T1-11-type plywood siding, and is accessed by a hollow-core wood door on the east side (see Figures 6 and 7).

Based on a professional assessment of materials and style (particularly of the garage doors), the garage dates to ca. 1950. In further support of this, the construction of a two-car garage in the 1920s or 1930, especially for a relatively modest property, would have been highly unusual, but it would have been much more common after World War II when multiple car ownership became more common.

Significance and Integrity

As defined by the National Park Service (1997), a resource may be significant and considered eligible for the NRHP if it:

- is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history (Criterion A); or
- is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past (Criterion B); or
- embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction (Criterion C); or
- yields, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history (Criterion D).

To be eligible for the NRHP (and to be designated as a Landmark Site by the PCMC Land Management Code) a resource that meets one or more of these criteria must also retain integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association.

Only the historic site form from 2008 evaluated the significance and integrity of the property at 1503 Park Avenue (Blaes 2008). The conclusion was that the house was significant under Criterion A for its association with Park City's Mature Mining Era (1894-1930). The eligibility of the property under Criteria B, C, and D was not evaluated. Although the construction date of ca. 1900 appears to be inaccurate, it seems certain that the house had been built by 1930 when the Petersons were the recorded owners. The house therefore remains significant (and eligible as a Landmark Site) only for its association with the Mature Mining Era.

Because the garage dates to ca. 1950, it falls outside of the period of significance for the property and can be considered a non-contributing outbuilding. The garage retains a high degree of integrity but it does not have enough significance in its own right to be listed on the NRHP or the PCMC HSI independently of the house, which is the principal building on the site.

Conclusion

In summary, the garage at 1503 Park Avenue falls outside the period of significance for the property and is therefore considered a non-contributing outbuilding.

References

Blaes, Dina

2008 Historic Site Form – Historic Sites Inventory form for 1503 Park Avenue, Park City, Summit County, Utah. On file at Planning Department, Park City Municipal Corporation, Park City, Utah.

Ewanowski, John

2015 Historic Site Form for Victor and Jennie Peterson House, 1503 Park Avenue, Park City, Summit County, Utah. Utah State Historic Preservation Office, Salt Lake City.

National Park Service

1997 National Register Bulletin: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation. U.S. Department of the Interior, Washington, DC.

Utah Division of Natural Resources

1952 Image No. 19156 (DRU 1K-75 B). Utah Geological Survey Aerial Imagery Collection. Available online at https://geodata.geology.utah.gov/imagery/. Accessed April 24, 2018.

1962 Image No. 70649 (DRU 3BB-120). Utah Geological Survey Aerial Imagery Collection. Available online at https://geodata.geology.utah.gov/imagery/. Accessed April 24, 2018.



Figure 1. Aerial photograph of property at 1503 Park Avenue, 1952. Garage indicated by red arrow. Courtesy Utah Division of Natural Resources.



Figure 2. Aerial photograph of property at 1503 Park Avenue, 1962. Garage indicated by red arrow. Courtesy Utah Division of Natural Resources.



Figure 3. Overview of house and garage at 1503 Park Avenue, 2018, view facing north.



Figure 4. West and south sides of garage at 1503 Park Avenue, 2018, view facing northeast.



Figure 5. South and east sides of garage at 1503 Park Avenue, 2018, view facing northwest.



Figure 6. Ca. 1995 shed-roofed addition on north side (rear) of garage at 1503 Park Avenue, 2018, view facing west.



Figure 7. North and west sides of garage at 1503 Park Avenue, 2018, view facing southeast.



Figure 8. Porcelain knob under east eave of garage at 1503 Park Avenue, 2018, view facing west.



Figure 9. Interior of south gable end of garage at 1503 Park Avenue, 2018, view facing south.



Figure 10. Roof framing system of garage at 1503 Park Avenue, 2018, view facing northwest.



Figure 11. Door-opening and bracing hardware on original garage doors at 1503 Park Avenue, 2018, view facing south.

15-11-12. DETERMINATION OF HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE

... It is hereby declared that all Buildings, Structures and Sites within Park City which substantially comply with the standards of review found in Section 15-11-[12](A), are determined to be Significant for the purposes of this Chapter.

(A) STANDARDS OF REVIEW. In determining the Historic Significance of the Property at the hearing, the HPB shall evaluate whether the Building, Structure or Site demonstrates a quality of Significance in local, regional, state or national history architecture,

archaeology, engineering or culture, and integrity of location, design, setting, materials, and workmanship according to the following criteria:



Criteria	Evaluation
(1) The Building, Structure or Site is associated with events or lives of Persons Significant to our past; and/or	Yes, mining era.
(2) The Building, Structure or Site embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction or that represent the work of a master; and/or	Yes, the building embodies the distinctive characteristics of type and period: one-story, frame, drop siding, period cottage, side-gable roof form, paired windows, gable entry porch.
(3) The architectural or historical value or Significance of the Building, Structure or Site contributes to the Historic value of the Property and surrounding Area; and/or	Yes, the architectural and historic value of the site contributes to the significance of the property and area.
(4) The Building, Structure, or Site is at least fifty (50) years old, or has achieved Significance within the past fifty (50) years if the Property is exceptional importance to the community; and/or	Yes, c. 1920
(5) The relation of Historic or architectural features found on the Building, Structure or Site to other such features within the surrounding Area; and/or	Yes, the architectural and historic features are comparable to those on other significant sites in the area.
(6) Any other factors, including aesthetic, which may be relevant to the historical or architectural aspects of the Building, Structure or Site.	Typical mining era cottage in scale, massing, and form.

In addition to on-site visual analysis, the following were consulted in determining substantial compliance with the standards of review found in Title 15, Chapter 11, Section 12 Determination of Historical Significance.

Tax Photo	SHPO
1982 Survey	
Evaluation	
Permit Files	
SHPO1	Utah Historic Sites Database ID # 57739.
Tax Assessor	
PCHS&M ²	
Other	Accessory structure

¹ State Historic Preservation Office

² Park City Historical Society and Museum

Exhibit D

HISTORIC SITE FORM

UTAH STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICE

1 IDENTIFICATION

Name of Property: Victor			T	washn	Danaa	Section:
Address: 1503 Park Avenue				wnshp	Range	section.
City, County: Park City,	Summit, Utah		U	TM:		
Current Owner Name:	Dennis Paul and	l Terri Hulbert (jt.)	USGS Map Name & Date: Park City W			Park City West
Current Owner Address: 1563 Tollgate Road		Quad/2011				
	Park City, UT 8	34098	Tax Number: SA-243			
Legal Description (includ	e acreage): see co	ontinuation sheet				
2 STATUS/USE						
<u>Property Category</u> <u>x</u> building(s) structure site object	ineli	<u>ion</u> ble/contributing gible/non-contributing of-period			e dwelling e dwelling	
3 DOCUMENTATION	I					
<u>Photos: Dates</u> <u>x</u> digital: Nov. 2013 (4) <u>x</u> prints: 1995, 2006 (2) <u>historic:</u> <u>Drawings and Plans</u> <u>measured floor plans</u> <u>site sketch map</u> <u>Historic American Bla</u>	la Gunuar	<u>Research Sources</u> (check of <u>x</u> abstract of title <u>x</u> tax card & photo _building permit _sewer permit <u>x</u> Sanborn Maps _obituary index _city directories/gazette census records		<u>x</u> city/ pers USH <u>x</u> USH USH LDS <u>x</u> loca	County historie Conal interviews IS History Rese IS Preservation IS Architects F S Family Histor	s s earch Center n Files ile y Library c City Museum

Bibliographical References (books, articles, interviews, etc.) Attach copies of all research notes, title searches, obituaries, and so forth.

Boutwell, John Mason and Lester Hood Woolsey. *Geology and Ore Deposits of the Park City District, Utah.* White Paper, Department of the Interior, United States Geological Survey. Washington: Government Printing Office, 1912.

biographical encyclopedias

<u>**x**</u> newspapers

Carter, Thomas and Peter Goss. *Utah's Historic Architecture, 1847-1940.* Salt Lake City: Center for Architectural Studies, Graduate School of Architecture, University of Utah and Utah State Historical Society, 1988.

Hampshire, David, Martha Sonntag Bradley and Allen Roberts. A History of Summit County. Coalville, UT: Summit County Commission, 1998.

National Register of Historic Places. Park City Main Street Historic District. Park City, Utah, National Register #79002511.

Peterson, Marie Ross and Mary M. Pearson. *Echoes of Yesterday: Summit County Centennial History*. Salt Lake City: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, 1947.

Pieros, Rick. Park City: Past & Present. Park City: self-published, 2011.

Randall, Deborah Lyn. Park City, Utah: An Architectural History of Mining Town Housing, 1869 to 1907. Master of Arts thesis, University of Utah, 1985.

Ringholz, Raye Carleson. *Diggings and Doings in Park City: Revised and Enlarged*. Salt Lake City: Western Epics, 1972. Ringholz, Raye Carleson and Bea Kummer. *Walking Through Historic Park City*. Self-published, 1984.

Thompson, George A., and Fraser Buck. *Treasure Mountain Home: Park City Revisited*. Salt Lake City: Dream Garden Press, 1993.

(10-91)

original plans available at:

_other:

4 ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

Building Style/Type: period cottage type	No. Stories: 1
Foundation Material: concrete	Wall Material(s): drop-novelty wood siding
Additions: <u>x</u> noneminormajor (describe below)	Alterations:none <u>x</u> minormajor (describe below)
Number of associated outbuildings <u>1</u> and/or structures	0.

Briefly describe the principal building, additions or alterations and their dates, and associated outbuildings and structures. Use continuation sheets as necessary.

1503 Park is a bungalow cottage type house that has not had many modifications made to it. While the bungalow cottage is not one of the main three house types built during the historic Park City mining era, it was still common during that time period. Not much is known about the early years of the house, as it is just outside of the boundaries for the Sanborn maps, and there is no historic tax photo to reference. Though the conclusions about the form are difficult to reach, the materials are telling, and do not appear to have been majorly altered. The side gable roof is sheathed with composition shingles, and the roof of the garage on the lot is sheathed with tar paper. The walls are clad with drop novelty wood siding, as are the walls of the garage. The windows are wooden single hung type windows, and there is a pair on either side of the centered door. The door appears to be a wood frame and panel door with three narrow upper lights, and has a wood screen door in front of it. A small gable protrudes from the roof to cover the porch area, and is supported by square wood piers that taper slightly towards the top. The house is raised up on a concrete foundation. The garage is to the rear of the house, and has space for two cars. The overall form and materiality of the building remains intact and the building retains its historic value.

5 HISTORY

Architect/Builder: unknown

Date of Construction: c. 1900

Historic Themes: Mark themes related to this property with "S" or "C" (S = significant, C = contributing). (see instructions for details)

(see instructions for e	<i>neterilis</i>)		
Agriculture	<u> Economics</u>	<u>C</u> Industry	Politics/
<u>C</u> Architecture	Education	Invention	Government
Archeology	Engineering	Landscape	Religion
Art	Entertainment/	Architecture	Science
<u>Commerce</u>	Recreation	Law	<u>Social History</u>
<u>Communications</u>	<u> </u>	Literature	<u> </u>
<u>Community</u> Planning	Exploration/	<u>Maritime History</u>	<u>C</u> Other: Mining
& Development	Settlement	Military	
<u>Conservation</u>	Health/Medicine	Performing Arts	

Write a chronological history of the property, focusing primarily on the original or principal owners & significant events. *Explain and justify any significant themes marked above. Use continuation sheets as necessary.*

This property is located outside of the original Park City survey, and it was owned by the Ontario Mining Company until the 1930s along with the other land in the southwest corner of Section 9. This combination makes it difficult to determine a construction date and early owners for the house, which was built around 1900. Furthermore, the property is outside of the Sanborn Map boundaries for Park City, so its development and renovations over time are difficult to understand.

The southwest corner of Section 9 was sold from Jacob Arthur to R.C. Chambers in 1878. Chambers was the director of the Ontario Mining Company, and he sold this land to the company in 1882. While the Ontario Company presumably prospected on this land, the closest developed mine was the Three Kings shaft on the mountainside to the west of town. The Ontario mines and mill were south of Park City, so it is unclear if they used this land to the north for anything. It was common for early Park City residents to live on land that they did not own, squatting in houses that were owned by mining companies or the Townsite Company. This was the case on this parcel, where the house was built decades before the title was deeded from the Ontario Mining Company to an individual owner.

Victor Peterson was the first individual owner of this property which he bought in 1935. Vic had been living in the house with his wife Jennie since at least 1930, as evidenced by the Federal Census of that year. Vic was born in 1893 in Millcreek, Utah, moving to Summit County as a child and attending Park City High School before enlisting in the Navy for World War I. After his returning from Europe, Vic and Jennie were married. Vic attended the University of Utah and became a teacher in the Park City schools, where he worked for over forty years. The Petersons lived at 1503 Park Avenue until 1973, when they moved to Salt Lake City. Victor Peterson died in 1982.

1503 Park was owned by the La Monde Partnership of Los Angeles from 1973 to 1975, when it was sold to Stephen Hurley and Fred Vedder. Hurley sold his interest in 1979 to Dennis Hulbert. Vedder sold his interest in 1991, and the property is currently owned entirely by Dennis and Terri Hulbert.

Legal Description (include acreage): PARCEL 1: BEG AT A PT 598 N & 1388 FT EOF THE SW COR OF SEC 9,T2SR4E,SLBM, & RUN TH N 25*24'W 52 FT; TH S 69*30'W160 FT; TH S 28*43'E 59.5 FT; TH N 62*0'E 156 FT TO THE PLACE OF BEG.EXCEPTING THEREFROM THE FOLLOWING: BEG AT A PT THAT IS N 578.88 FT & E1224.58 FT FR THE SW COR OF SEC 9,T2SR4E SLBM (BASIS OF BEARING BEING S 89*36'30'' E FR SD SW COR OF SEC 9 TO THE SE COR OF THE SE 1/4 OF THE SW 1/4 OF SDSEC 9); SD PT ALSO BEING THE SW COR OF SILVER TOWN CONDOMINIUMS AS RECORDED07-19-76 AS ENTRY NO 132627 IN OFFICE OF SUMMIT COUNTY RECORDER; TH N 34*35'00''W 12.87 FT; TH N 69*30'00'' E 158.46 FT; TH S 25*24'00'' E 14.30 FT TO A PT ON THE S'LY PROPERTY LINE OF SD SILVER TOWN CONDO; TH ALG SD S'LY PROPERTY LINE S70*08'43'' W 156.56 FT TO THE PT OF BEG. ALSO PARCEL 2:BEG AT A PT 598 FT N & 1388 FT E FR THE SW COR OF SEC 9,T2SR4E,SLBM; & RUN THALG THE E'LY LINE OF THAT CERTAIN PROPERTY DESC IN A DEED, ENTITLED''CONVEYANCE & OPTION'', RECORDED NO 55509 IN BOOK F OF QCD PAG 482, IN SUMMITCOUNTY RECORDERS OFFICE N 25*24'00" W 48.03 FT; TH N 69*45'15" E 8.84 FT TO APT ON THE W'LY R/W LINE OF PARK AVE, SD PT IS LOCATED S 24*24'28" E (PARK CITYMONUMENT CONTROL MAP S 24*31'00" E) 251.30 FT & S 65*35'32" W 33.00 FT FRTHE SURVEY MONUMENT LOCATED AT THE INT/SEC OF PARK AVE & EMPIRE AVE; TH ALG THE W'LY R/W LINE OF PARK AVE S 24*24' 28'' E 91.13 FT; TH ALG THE N'LY LINE OFTHAT CERTAIN QCD BOOK 353 PAGES 667-668 ENTRY #238494 IN OFFICE OF SUMMIT COUNTY RECORDER, S 65*08'30" W 9.51 FT; TH ALG THE N'LY LINE OF THAT CERTAIN PROPERTYDESC IN DEED ENTITLED "CONVEYANCE & OPTION", RECORDED QCDF-507 ENTRY #56281SUMMIT COUNTY RECORDERS OFFICE, S 65*08'30" W 150.88 FT; TH N 28*43'00'' W 48.72FT; TH ALG THE S'LY LINE OF THAT CERTAIN PROPERTY DESCRIBED IN A DEED, ENTITLED"CONVEYANCE & OPTION", RECORDED IN NO 55509 IN BOOK F OF QCD, PAGE 482 INSUMMIT COUNTY RECORDERS OFFICE, N 66*54' 02" E 156.10 FT (DEED N 62*00'00" E156.00 FT) TO THE PT OF BEG DESC CONT 7,873.04 SQ FT(LESS ANY PORTION LYING IN SILVER TOWN CONDO) BAL 0.33 ACRES M51-517 M67-352M128-350 593-463 615-523 629-777-780 (SEE 630-244 AFFIDAVIT) 939-258

1503 Park Avenue, Park City, Summit County, Utah Historic Site Form—continuation sheet



1503 Park Avenue. Southeast oblique. November 2013.



1503 Park Avenue and outbuilding. Southwest oblique. November 2013.

1503 Park Avenue, Park City, Summit County, Utah

Historic Site Form—continuation sheet



1503 Park Avenue. East elevation. November 2013.



1503 Park Avenue. Northeast oblique. November 2013.

TITLE SEARCH FORM

[Obtain information from title abstract books at County Recorder's Office]

Tax Number: SA-243

Address:1503 Park AvenueCity:Park City, UTCurrent Owner:Dennis Paul and Terri HulbertAddress:(see historic site form for address)

Legal Description (include acreage): see historic site form for complete legal description

TRANSACTION DATES	GRANTOR (SELLER)	GRANTEE (BUYER)	TYPE OF TRANSACTION	DOLLAR AMOUNT	COMMENTS
11/4/1878	Jacob Arthur	Robert C. Chambers	W		[SW quarter S9]
5/20/1882	R.C. Chambers	Ontario Silver Mining Company	Q		[see record for legal description]
3/12/1924	Ontario Silver Mg. Co.	Ontario Silver Mg. Co.	Deed		"SW 1/4 [S9], excepting"
8/15/1935	Ontario Silver Mn'g Co.	Victor Peterson	Q.C.D.		
6/13/1958	Victor E. & Jennie Peterson	Victor E. & Jennie Peterson	W.D.		
10/18/1973	Victor E. & Jennie Peterson	La Monde Partnership of LA	W.D.		598'N & 1388'E fr SW corner Sec. 9
5/8/1975	La Monde Partnership of LA	Stephen Hurley & Fred Vedder	W.D.		
2/20/1979	Stephen Hurley & Fred Vedder	Fred Vedder & Dennis Hulbert	W.D.		(Vedder und. 75% int.; Hurlbert 25% und. int.)
10/24/1991	Fred Vedder	Dennis Hulbert	W.D.		

Researcher: John Ewanowski, CRSA Architecture

Date: 9/24/2014

1503 Park Avenue, Park City, Summit County, Utah Intensive Level Survey—Sanborn Map history



Vic Peterson Retires after Serving Youth of Park City for 40 Years

PARK CITY-

After 40 years of teaching in the Park Cily schools, Mr. Vicior Peterson retires as mathematics instructor at the Park City High School.

Busy Caroor Mr. Peterson was born in Mill Creek, Utah, and moved to Park Cily al an early age, He graduatod from the Park City High School and received a B. S. dostee irom the University of Ulah, ?. Mr. Peterson began his teach-ing in Sayderyllie where he taught from 1920 to 1924 when he transferred to the Jefferson School in Park City, From 1924 to 1936, ex-.cept for one year's heave to at-tend the University, he taught at the Lincoln School. In 1936 he

transferred to the Marcae Junior High where he romained unlik 1942 when he was assigned to the Park Cityl High School as mathematics instructor, which posi-tion he hold at the time of his relirement.

ber of the American Legion Post, having served two terms as commander; Since 1952 he has been

Post Adjutant. He served as Scoutmaster for the LDS Boy

He is married to Jennie Colman of New York City. High in Their Praise

School patrons and former studentse are upanimous in their praises for his unfailing dedication in teaching and hope his futore years will be pleasant and enjovable.

Park Record, 8/31/1961



VIC PETERSON

Mr. Peterson, "Vie" as he is best known to his host of friends, is retiring due to in health,

Mr. Peterson served in the Ho has been a resident of the Navy during World War J. Ho park City area for the past 55 has always been an active mem-pears and plans to remain in his home lown Park City, in the conler of his lishing and hunting grounds, and among his "fishing

pais," where he is happlest. The Petersons plan to spend Scouls for saveral years and later part of the winter in a militar was Scoulinaster for the Klwasis climale for the benefit of his Troop. of his irlands that his health will improve greatly and we may enjoy his pleasant association with Park City residents for many years yet to come.

Congratulations and all good wishes are extended to Victor Peterson for a busy and happy ettrement.



Vic Petersons Note Golden Date

Fifty years ago Victor Peter-son took Jennte Coleman as his bride on Aprit 26, 1919, in Jennie's home town, Yonkers, New York, On April 26, 1969 the Park City couple wilt be honored at a Golden Wedding Anniversary reception at the Silver King Motel.

Mr. and Mrs. Peierson met when Victor was back east during his military service in World War I. Shorily after their wedding they came to Utah and lived in Snyderville about five years before moving in 1925 to their present home at 1503 Park Avenue, Park City.

Victor is a 1916 graduate of

Park Record, 4/17/1969

the Park City Htgh School where he taught math as well as other subjects during his 40-year ienure as a teacher in the Park City School District. He laught at the Marsac School prior to his high school leaching.

Mrs. Goldie Voigt, of Nampa, Idaho and a sister of Victor, and Mr. and Mrs. William Blonquist are sponsoring the "Open House" io which all friends of the Golden Wedding couple are invited. The reception will be from 3 to 5 p.m. Victor and Jennie ask that no gifts be sent or brought. They just want to greet their friends.

1503 Park Avenue, Park City, Summit County, Utah

Intensive Level Survey—USGS Map



Exhibit E

HISTORIC SITE FORM PARK CITY MUNICIPAL CORPORATION (11-16)

1 IDENTIFICATION

<u>x</u> digital: Nov. 2013 (4)

x prints: 1995, 2006 (2)

<u>____</u>measured floor plans

Historic American Bldg. Survey

__original plans available at:

Drawings and Plans

____site sketch map

historic:

__other:

Name of Property: Victo	r and Jennie Peterson House				
Address: 1503 Park Avenue			Range	Section:	
City, County: Park City,	UTM:				
Current Owner Name: Dennis Paul and Terri Hulbert (jt.)		USGS Map Name & Date: Park City West			
Current Owner Address: 1563 Tollgate Road		Quad/2011			
	Park City, UT 84098	Tax Number: SA-243			
Legal Description (includ	de acreage): see continuation sheet				
2 STATUS/USE					
Property Category x building(s)main building(s) attached building(s) detached building(s) public building(s) accessory structure(s) National Register of Hist	not historic	<u>Use</u> Original Use: single Current Use: single Listed (date:)	-		
3 DOCUMENTATION	ST				
5 DOCUMENTATION					
Photos: Dates	Research Sources (chec	ck all sources consulted,	whether useful	or not)	

<u>**x**</u> abstract of title

x tax card & photo

building permit

____sewer permit

<u>x</u> Sanborn Maps ____obituary index

census records

<u>x</u>newspapers

<u>_____city directories/gazetteers</u>

_biographical encyclopedias

Bibliographical References (books, articles, interviews, etc.) Attach copies of all research notes, title searches, obituaries, and so forth.

Boutwell, John Mason and Lester Hood Woolsey. *Geology and Ore Deposits of the Park City District, Utah.* White Paper, Department of the Interior, United States Geological Survey. Washington: Government Printing Office, 1912.

Carter, Thomas and Peter Goss. *Utah's Historic Architecture, 1847-1940.* Salt Lake City: Center for Architectural Studies, Graduate School of Architecture, University of Utah and Utah State Historical Society, 1988.

Hampshire, David, Martha Sonntag Bradley and Allen Roberts. A History of Summit County. Coalville, UT: Summit County Commission, 1998.

National Register of Historic Places. Park City Main Street Historic District. Park City, Utah, National Register #79002511.

Peterson, Marie Ross and Mary M. Pearson. *Echoes of Yesterday: Summit County Centennial History*. Salt Lake City: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, 1947.

Pieros, Rick. Park City: Past & Present. Park City: self-published, 2011.

Randall, Deborah Lyn. Park City, Utah: An Architectural History of Mining Town Housing, 1869 to 1907. Master of Arts thesis, University of Utah, 1985.

Ringholz, Raye Carleson. *Diggings and Doings in Park City: Revised and Enlarged*. Salt Lake City: Western Epics, 1972. Ringholz, Raye Carleson and Bea Kummer. *Walking Through Historic Park City*. Self-published, 1984.

Thompson, George A., and Fraser Buck. *Treasure Mountain Home: Park City Revisited*. Salt Lake City: Dream Garden Press, 1993.

<u>**x**</u> city/county histories

personal interviews

<u>USHS</u> Architects File

university library(ies):

<u>USHS</u> History Research Center <u>x</u> USHS Preservation Files

___LDS Family History Library _x local library: Park City Museum

4 ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

Building Style/Type: period cottage type	No. Stories: 1
Foundation Material: concrete	Wall Material(s): drop-novelty wood siding
Additions: <u>x</u> noneminormajor (describe below)	Alterations:none <u>x</u> minormajor (describe below)
Number of associated outbuildings <u>1</u> and/or structures	s <u>0</u> .

Briefly describe the principal building, additions or alterations and their dates, and associated outbuildings and structures. Use continuation sheets as necessary.

1503 Park is a bungalow cottage type house that has not had many modifications made to it. While the bungalow cottage is not one of the main three house types built during the historic Park City mining era, it was still common during that time period. Not much is known about the early years of the house, as it is just outside of the boundaries for the Sanborn maps, and there is no historic tax photo to reference. Though the conclusions about the form are difficult to reach, the materials are telling, and do not appear to have been majorly altered. The side gable roof is sheathed with composition shingles, and the roof of the garage on the lot is sheathed with tar paper. The walls are clad with drop novelty wood siding, as are the walls of the garage. The windows are wooden single hung type windows, and there is a pair on either side of the centered door. The door appears to be a wood frame and panel door with three narrow upper lights, and has a wood screen door in front of it. A small gable protrudes from the roof to cover the porch area, and is supported by square wood piers that taper slightly towards the top. The house is raised up on a concrete foundation. The overall form and materiality of the building remains intact and the building retains its historic value.

5 HISTORY

Architect/Builder: unknown

Date of Construction: c. 1930

Historic Themes: Mark themes related to this property with "S" or "C" (S = significant, C = contributing). (see instructions for details)

(see instructions for e	<i>(((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((</i>		
Agriculture	Economics	<u>C</u> Industry	Politics/
<u>C</u> Architecture	Education	Invention	Government
Archeology	Engineering	Landscape	Religion
Art	Entertainment/	Architecture	Science
<u>Commerce</u>	Recreation	Law	<u>Social History</u>
<u>Communications</u>	<u> </u>	<u>Literature</u>	<u> </u>
<u>Community</u> Planning	Exploration/	<u>Maritime History</u>	<u>C</u> Other: Mining
& Development	Settlement	Military	
<u>Conservation</u>	Health/Medicine	Performing Arts	

Write a chronological history of the property, focusing primarily on the original or principal owners & significant events. *Explain and justify any significant themes marked above. Use continuation sheets as necessary.*

This property is located outside of the original Park City survey, and it was owned by the Ontario Mining Company until the 1930s along with the other land in the southwest corner of Section 9. This combination makes it difficult to determine a construction date and early owners for the house, which was built around 1900. Furthermore, the property is outside of the Sanborn Map boundaries for Park City, so its development and renovations over time are difficult to understand.

The southwest corner of Section 9 was sold from Jacob Arthur to R.C. Chambers in 1878. Chambers was the director of the Ontario Mining Company, and he sold this land to the company in 1882. While the Ontario Company presumably prospected on this land, the closest developed mine was the Three Kings shaft on the mountainside to the west of town. The Ontario mines and mill were south of Park City, so it is unclear if they used this land to the north for anything. It was common for early Park City residents to live on land that they did not own, squatting in houses that were owned by mining companies or the Townsite Company. This was the case on this parcel, where the house was built decades before the title was deeded from the Ontario Mining Company to an individual owner.

Victor Peterson was the first individual owner of this property which he bought in 1935. Vic had been living in the house with his wife Jennie since at least 1930, as evidenced by the Federal Census of that year. Vic was born in 1893 in Millcreek, Utah, moving to Summit County as a child and attending Park City High School before enlisting in the Navy for World War I. After his returning from Europe, Vic and Jennie were married. Vic attended the University of Utah and became a teacher in the Park City schools, where he worked for over forty years. The Petersons lived at 1503 Park Avenue until 1973, when they moved to Salt Lake City. Victor Peterson died in 1982.

1503 Park was owned by the La Monde Partnership of Los Angeles from 1973 to 1975, when it was sold to Stephen Hurley and Fred Vedder. Hurley sold his interest in 1979 to Dennis Hulbert. Vedder sold his interest in 1991, and the property is currently owned entirely by Dennis and Terri Hulbert.

Legal Description (include acreage): PARCEL 1: BEG AT A PT 598 N & 1388 FT EOF THE SW COR OF SEC 9,T2SR4E,SLBM, & RUN TH N 25*24'W 52 FT; TH S 69*30'W160 FT; TH S 28*43'E 59.5 FT; TH N 62*0'E 156 FT TO THE PLACE OF BEG.EXCEPTING THEREFROM THE FOLLOWING: BEG AT A PT THAT IS N 578.88 FT & E1224.58 FT FR THE SW COR OF SEC 9,T2SR4E SLBM (BASIS OF BEARING BEING S 89*36'30'' E FR SD SW COR OF SEC 9 TO THE SE COR OF THE SE 1/4 OF THE SW 1/4 OF SDSEC 9); SD PT ALSO BEING THE SW COR OF SILVER TOWN CONDOMINIUMS AS RECORDED07-19-76 AS ENTRY NO 132627 IN OFFICE OF SUMMIT COUNTY RECORDER; TH N 34*35'00''W 12.87 FT; TH N 69*30'00'' E 158.46 FT; TH S 25*24'00'' E 14.30 FT TO A PT ON THE S'LY PROPERTY LINE OF SD SILVER TOWN CONDO; TH ALG SD S'LY PROPERTY LINE S70*08'43'' W 156.56 FT TO THE PT OF BEG. ALSO PARCEL 2:BEG AT A PT 598 FT N & 1388 FT E FR THE SW COR OF SEC 9,T2SR4E,SLBM; & RUN THALG THE E'LY LINE OF THAT CERTAIN PROPERTY DESC IN A DEED, ENTITLED"CONVEYANCE & OPTION", RECORDED NO 55509 IN BOOK F OF QCD PAG 482, IN SUMMITCOUNTY RECORDERS OFFICE N 25*24'00" W 48.03 FT; TH N 69*45'15" E 8.84 FT TO APT ON THE W'LY R/W LINE OF PARK AVE, SD PT IS LOCATED S 24*24'28'' E (PARK CITYMONUMENT CONTROL MAP S 24*31'00" E) 251.30 FT & S 65*35'32" W 33.00 FT FRTHE SURVEY MONUMENT LOCATED AT THE INT/SEC OF PARK AVE & EMPIRE AVE; TH ALG THE W'LY R/W LINE OF PARK AVE S 24*24' 28'' E 91.13 FT; TH ALG THE N'LY LINE OFTHAT CERTAIN QCD BOOK 353 PAGES 667-668 ENTRY #238494 IN OFFICE OF SUMMIT COUNTY RECORDER, S 65*08'30'' W 9.51 FT; TH ALG THE N'LY LINE OF THAT CERTAIN PROPERTYDESC IN DEED ENTITLED "CONVEYANCE & OPTION", RECORDED QCDF-507 ENTRY #56281SUMMIT COUNTY RECORDERS OFFICE, S 65*08'30'' W 150.88 FT; TH N 28*43'00'' W 48.72FT; TH ALG THE S'LY LINE OF THAT CERTAIN PROPERTY DESCRIBED IN A DEED, ENTITLED"CONVEYANCE & OPTION", RECORDED IN NO 55509 IN BOOK F OF QCD, PAGE 482 INSUMMIT COUNTY RECORDERS OFFICE, N 66*54' 02" E 156.10 FT (DEED N 62*00'00" E156.00 FT) TO THE PT OF BEG DESC CONT 7,873.04 SQ FT(LESS ANY PORTION LYING IN SILVER TOWN CONDO) BAL 0.33 ACRES M51-517 M67-352M128-350 593-463 615-523 629-777-780 (SEE 630-244 AFFIDAVIT) 939-258

1503 Park Avenue, Park City, Summit County, Utah Historic Site Form—continuation sheet



1503 Park Avenue. Southeast oblique. November 2013.



1503 Park Avenue and outbuilding. Southwest oblique. November 2013.

1503 Park Avenue, Park City, Summit County, Utah Historic Site Form—continuation sheet



1503 Park Avenue. East elevation. November 2013.



1503 Park Avenue. Northeast oblique. November 2013.





TITLE SEARCH FORM

[Obtain information from title abstract books at County Recorder's Office]

Tax Number: SA-243

Address: 1503 Park Avenue City: Park City, UT Current Owner: Dennis Paul and Terri Hulbert Address: (see historic site form for address)

Legal Description (include acreage): see historic site form for complete legal description

TRANSACTION DATES	GRANTOR (SELLER)	GRANTEE (BUYER)	TYPE OF TRANSACTION	DOLLAR AMOUNT	COMMENTS
11/4/1878	Jacob Arthur	Robert C. Chambers	W		[SW quarter S9]
5/20/1882	R.C. Chambers	Ontario Silver Mining Company	Q		[see record for legal description]
3/12/1924	Ontario Silver Mg. Co.	Ontario Silver Mg. Co.	Deed		"SW 1/4 [S9], excepting"
8/15/1935	Ontario Silver Mn'g Co.	Victor Peterson	Q.C.D.		
6/13/1958	Victor E. & Jennie Peterson	Victor E. & Jennie Peterson	W.D.		
10/18/1973	Victor E. & Jennie Peterson	La Monde Partnership of LA	W.D.		598'N & 1388'E fr SW corner Sec. 9
5/8/1975	La Monde Partnership of LA	Stephen Hurley & Fred Vedder	W.D.		
2/20/1979	Stephen Hurley & Fred Vedder	Fred Vedder & Dennis Hulbert	W.D.		(Vedder und. 75% int.; Hurlbert 25% und. int.)
10/24/1991	Fred Vedder	Dennis Hulbert	W.D.		

Researcher: John Ewanowski, CRSA Architecture

Date: 9/24/2014

1503 Park Avenue, Park City, Summit County, Utah Intensive Level Survey—Sanborn Map history



Vic Peterson Retires after Serving Youth of Park City for 40 Years

PARK CITY-

After 40 years of teaching in the Park Cily schools, Mr. Vicior Peterson retires as mathematics instructor at the Park City High School.

Busy Caroor Mr. Peterson was born in Mill Creek, Utah, and moved to Park Cily al an early age, He graduatod from the Park City High School and received a B. S. dostee irom the University of Ulah, ?. Mr. Peterson began his teach-ing in Sayderyllie where he taught from 1920 to 1924 when he transferred to the Jefferson School in Park City, From 1924 to 1936, ex-.cept for one year's heave to at-tend the University, he taught at the Lincoln School. In 1936 he transferred to the Marcae Junior High where he romained unlik

1942 when he was assigned to the Park Cityl High School as mathematics instructor, which posi-tion he hold at the time of his relirement.

ber of the American Legion Post, having served two terms as commander; Since 1952 he has been

Post Adjutant. He served as Scoutmaster for the LDS Boy

He is married to Jennie Colman of New York City. High in Their Praise

School patrons and former studentse are upanimous in their praises for his unfailing dedication in teaching and hope his futore years will be pleasant and enjovable.

Park Record, 8/31/1961



VIC PETERSON

Mr. Peterson, "Vie" as he is best known to his host of friends, is retiring due to in health,

Mr. Peterson served in the Ho has been a resident of the Navy during World War J. Ho park City area for the past 55 has always been an active mem-pears and plans to remain in his home lown Park City, in the conler of his lishing and hunting grounds, and among his "fishing

pais," where he is happlest. The Petersons plan to spend Scouls for saveral years and later part of the winter in a militar was Scoulinaster for the Klwasis climale for the benefit of his Troop. of his irlands that his health will improve greatly and we may enjoy his pleasant association with Park City residents for many years yet to come.

Congratulations and all good wishes are extended to Victor Peterson for a busy and happy ettrement.



Vic Petersons Note Golden Date

Fifty years ago Victor Peter-son took Jennte Coleman as his bride on Aprit 26, 1919, in Jennie's home town, Yonkers, New York, On April 26, 1969 the Park City couple wilt be honored at a Golden Wedding Anniversary reception at the Silver King Motel.

Mr. and Mrs. Peierson met when Victor was back east during his military service in World War I. Shorily after their wedding they came to Utah and lived in Snyderville about five years before moving in 1925 to their present home at 1503 Park Avenue, Park City.

Victor is a 1916 graduate of

Park Record, 4/17/1969

the Park City Htgh School where he taught math as well as other subjects during his 40-year ienure as a teacher in the Park City School District. He laught at the Marsac School prior to his high school leaching.

Mrs. Goldie Voigt, of Nampa, Idaho and a sister of Victor, and Mr. and Mrs. William Blonquist are sponsoring the "Open House" io which all friends of the Golden Wedding couple are invited. The reception will be from 3 to 5 p.m. Victor and Jennie ask that no gifts be sent or brought. They just want to greet their friends.

1503 Park Avenue, Park City, Summit County, Utah

Intensive Level Survey—USGS Map

